

STUDY

Country Specific Recommendations for 2016 and 2017

A comparison and an overview of implementation

This document presents:

- The <u>Country Specific Recommendations for 2016</u> generally endorsed by the European Council on 28/29 June 2016 and adopted by the Council on 12 July 2016;
- The assessment of the implementation of 2016 Country Specific Recommendations based on the <u>European Commission Country Reports</u> as published on 22 February 2017;
- The <u>Draft Country Specific Recommendations for 2017</u> proposed by the European Commission (COM) on 22 May 2017 and to be adopted by the Council in July 2017; and
- The Council Recommendation on the economic policy of the euro area approved by the Council on 21 March 2017.

A specific policy recommendation may relate to a specific EU policy objective and underlying legal procedure:

- The first CSR generally refers to **fiscal policies.** It could therefore trigger further procedural steps either under the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact (SGP) (in accordance with <u>Regulation 1466/97</u>, <u>Regulation 1467/97</u>, and <u>Regulation 1173/2011</u>).
- If the Member State is **experiencing macro-economic imbalances**, then one or more CSRs may refer to these imbalances and could therefore trigger further procedural steps under the Macro-Economic Imbalances Procedure (MIP) (in accordance with <u>Regulation 1176/2011</u> and <u>Regulation 1174/2011</u>).
- Other CSRs may address **other major economic policy objectives**, such as growth enhancing structural reforms, employment and social aspects and/or financial market stability (in accordance with the integrated guidelines adopted under Articles 121(2), 136 and 148(4) of the <u>TFEU</u>).
- ▶ The 2017 CSRs have been re-arranged in the table below, where applicable, by policy area to allow for an easier comparison with the 2016 CSRs.
- The "colour code" used for the assessment of CSR implementation is based on the categories presented in the Commission (COM) Country Reports:

 "red" = "no progress" or "limited progress"; "yellow" = "some progress"; "green" = "substantial progress" or "full progress" (see assessment criteria).

Click to Scroll-down: BE, BG, CZ, DK, DE, EE, IE, EL, ES, FR, HR, IT, CY, LV, LT, LU, HU, MT, NL, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK, Euro Area

BE	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
	1. Achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of at least 0,6 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017. Use windfall gains to accelerate the reduction of the general government debt ratio. Agree on an enforceable distribution of fiscal targets among all government levels. Simplify the tax system and remove distortive tax expenditures.	 Limited progress (this overall assessment of country-specific recommendation 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact): Limited progress has been made towards an enforceable distribution of fiscal targets among the various levels of government. The lack of any formal commitment by the regions and communities to disaggregated fiscal trajectories at their own level undermines the credibility of Belgium's overall trajectory and hampers debt reduction efforts. Some progress has been made in reforming the tax system: The federal government has announced its intention to reform corporate taxation in the direction of reducing the nominal statutory rate. A report of the High Council for Finance was published in July 2016 analysing options. As yet, no firm plans have been brought forward. Measures included in the draft budgetary plan: a further increase of the withholding tax rate, from 27 % to 30 %; an increase (ceiling is doubled) and broadening (foreign platforms also taxed) of the stock-exchange tax; the abolition of the 'speculation tax'; the introduction of a mobility budget for employees as an alternative to a company car and of a fixed levy imposed on employers for company fuel cards. 	1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of Belgium's public finances. Agree on an enforceable distribution of fiscal targets among government levels and ensure independent fiscal monitoring. Remove distortive tax expenditures. Improve the composition of public spending in order to create room for infrastructure investment, including on transport infrastructure.

	• Other measures legislated or announced since July 2016:	
	 Abolition of existing patent income deduction regime (1 July 2016); approval by Council of Ministers of draft bill on Innovation Income Deduction regime (2 December 2016); 	
	 Legislation for the specific fiscal treatment of income received by private individuals providing services through the sharing economy under certain circumstances (1 July); 	
	Online betting and gambling activities no longer exempt from VAT (1 August);	
	 New single annual bank tax replaces four existing taxes (act passed on 3 August). 	
2. Carry out the intended review of the Law of 1996 on the promotion of employment and the safeguarding of competitiveness in consultation with the social partners. Ensure that wages can evolve in line with productivity. Ensure the effectiveness of labour market activation policies. Move forward with education and vocational training reforms and provide training support for disadvantaged groups, in particular people from a migrant background.	Substantial progress: Substantial progress has been made in making wage formation more responsive to the business cycle and changes in productivity. The law on the revision of the 1996 Law on employment and competitiveness is to be voted by parliament in February 2017. It has already been taken into account in the Inter Professional Agreement agreed between the Social Partners on 31/01/2017. Some progress has been made on ensuring the effectiveness of labour market activation policies. Taxes on labour are being progressively decreased and eligibility conditions for pre-retirement and	2. Ensure that the most disadvantaged groups, including people with migrant background, have equal access to quality education, vocational training, and the labour market.
	retirement are progressively being tightened. These ongoing reforms are producing positive effects on take home pay for low and average wage earners as well as on the participation rate of the older workers. • The law on flexible and workable work includes a number of measures to increase the flexibility of working time arrangements and to promote incompany training. It also reintroduces the possibility of a lower minimum wage for young people.	

- The three regions and the German-speaking Community have started to reform the recently devolved competences in the area of activation. The existing employment incentive schemes are being rationalised to focus financial support on a limited number of priority groups and to better integrate employment support with other types of activation measures. The reformed employment support systems are already operational in Flanders as of January 2017 and will become fully operational in Wallonia and Brussels in the course of 2017.
- In November 2016 the "Individualised Project for Social Integration" of the Federal government became compulsory for all new living wage beneficiaries.
- At the end of 2016 the federal government introduced a number of measures to make resuming work after work incapacity financially more attractive.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made on educational and vocational reforms.

- In May 2016, the Flemish Community launched two concept notes 'Modernising secondary education, measures for primary education and the first stage' and 'The second and third stage of secondary education'. This started the rollout of the final measures of the master plan secondary education.
- After a consultation, the Flemish government adopted in January 2017 the final measures of the Flemish modernisation of secondary education. Key measures plan for a new ordering of the study offer and the rationalisation from 29 to 8 study areas. In 2017 a first draft a new parliamentary act for the modernisation of secondary education will be presented to the government. The legislative framework will be elaborated with the aim of reaching a progressive implementation school year

- by school year from 1st of September 2018 onwards (starting with the first grade of the first stage).
- On learning outcomes, the 2016 societal debate on the attainment targets resulted in final reports which have been handed over to the Flemish Parliament. In the phased rollout of the renewed attainment targets, the update and development of attainment targets for a selection of sets of targets for primary education and the first stage of secondary education will start in 2017.
- The French Community has launched a process to reform its compulsory education system over the period 2015-2030 (Pacte pour un Enseignement d'Excellence). Based on the main orientations approved by the government mid-2016 and on an impact assessment, the December 2016 draft advice of the steering group sets the proposed five strategic axes, objectives and priorities. Great attention is given to early childhood education. Initial Vocational Education and Training (IVET) would be reduced to one track with fewer study options and apprenticeships integrated into the education system. After a two months consultation period, the advice is expected to be finalised in view of its adoption by the government, early 2017. The implementation period has been extended from 2025 till 2030;
- Independently of the "Pacte", first measures have been approved namely with the so-called "Décret fourre-tout" adopted in 2016. Mandatory support to starting teachers has been introduced in September 2016. Each school will also be required to establish by 2018/2019 a 6-year pilot plan with objectives in more than 10 key areas. The heads of underperforming schools have to draw up a remedial action plan with the support of their umbrella organisation;
- Both communities are pursuing the preparation of their reform of initial teacher education launched under the previous governments. On teachers'

	careers, the Flemish education minister and social partners are still pursuing their negotiations on a 'career pact' (Loopbaanpact). The reform of teacher's careers is part of the school reform of the French Community.	
3. Boost the capacity to innovate, in particular by fostering investment in knowledge-based capital. Increase competition in the business services sector and the retail sector by removing unwarranted operational and establishment restrictions. Address shortfalls in investment in transport infrastructure and energy generation capacity.	 Limited progress has been made to boost the capacity to innovate: Major multi-annual plans for R&I include successive versions of the 'Marshall plan' complemented by 'Creative Wallonia' and 'Digital Wallonia' in Wallonia; regional innovation plan in Brussels; and 'VISIE 2050: a long-term strategy for Flanders' in Flanders. These main regional strategies reflect a broad political commitment to boost productivity and address societal challenges through research and 	3. Foster investment in knowledge-based capital, notably with measures to increase digital technologies adoption, and innovation diffusion. Increase competition in professional services markets and retail, and enhance market mechanisms in network industries.
	 In July 2016, the Brussels region updated its innovation strategy plan for the period 2016-2020. In July 2016, the federal government introduced a 	
	fiscal regime for workers of the "Collaborative economy". This was introduced under the "Digital Belgium" initiative, which aims to stimulate entrepreneurship and new economic activities, while providing a clear legal framework. The regime foresees an effective 10% tax rate under 5.000 EUR gross income for individuals providing services via a recognized collaborative platform (Loi-Programme/Programmawet 01/07/2016 and two Royal Decrees 24/01/2017).	
	• The Belgian 'Patent Box' regime has effectively been abolished on 1 July 2016. It will be accompanied by a transitory regime of five years. The federal government is working on a new regime entitled 'deduction for innovation income' to bring it in line with the 'modified nexus approach' as introduced by the OECD (BEPS/action 5). The draft	

- law has been submitted to the State Council for its opinion. Adoption is expected early 2017.
- Flanders and the French Community agreed on the future of the Interuniversity attraction poles whose current financing commitment ends in September 2017 (managed at Federal level before the 6th State Reform). A new programme will start in 2018, comanaged by FWO and CNRS with a dedicated budget of 17.7 million (Flanders) and 13.9 million (French Community) starting in 2018.
- The Brussels Small Business Act is a plan/vision structured around 77 measures within five development pillars to be implemented between 2016 and 2025. It covers enabling an environment for creation, regardless of the life stage of the company or its model; improving access to finance, using a credit intermediary (development of a regional strategy for microcredit, increase the microfinance capacity); supporting the diversity of entrepreneurs and businesses through segmented measures; improving the relations between SMEs and the Brussels capital region by making the administration more "business friendly"; supporting companies in their development (innovation, internationalization, digitization, circular economy). Most of the implementation should start in 2017.
- In October 2016 the Flemish region adopted a new action plan for innovation procurement. The new action plan is based on a combination of precommercial procurement (PCP) and public procurement of innovative solutions (PPI). It foresees co-financing for Flemish procurers to kickstart 5 new PCP and 10 PPI lighthouse projects in 2017.
- As announced in its 2017 budget, Flanders will structurally increase its public R&D budget, mostly to the benefit of Public Research Organisations, in line with its commitment that public R&D intensity should reach 1% in Flanders (currently 0.78%).

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made on increasing competition in the business and professional services:

End of 2016, a proposal for on the transposition of the Directive 2013/55/EU was voted in the Belgian parliament. For intra-Belgian consistency reasons, a cooperation agreement will be drafted. For Flanders, an implementation law has been submitted to the Flemish parliament. According to the Walloon representative, an orientation note is submitted to the Walloon government, presenting the screening of existing legislation in the area of regulated professions. In the Brussels region, the regional government needs to decide on the proposal for the implementation law.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made on removing unwarranted operational and establishment restrictions in the retail sectors:

- Further to the 6th State reform transferring competences on retail establishment, the three regions have adopted acts regulating this field (Flanders, as the last region, adopted the relevant act in July 2016, however the provisions relating to authorisations for retail outlets will not enter into force before 2018). The new regional laws provide for some simplification of administrative procedures, but the substantive conditions for granting authorisations leave a broad margin for interpretation. The concrete implementation of these rules will be important to ensure that these do not lead to market entry barriers.
- As regards e-commerce, the Royal Decree from March 2016 has made night work related to on-line sales in the retail sector possible.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made on addressing shortfalls in investment:

• In September 2016, the federal government proposed	
to implement a National Pact for Strategic	
Investments, calling upon private and public	
investors to work together in order to boost	
investment in a number of key strategic sectors,	
namely energy, security, transport and the digital	
economy. The roll-out of the plan is foreseen over	
the period 2017-2030. The governance and policy	
choices will be determined in more detail in	
cooperation with the concerned government levels in	
order to ensure the speedy implementation of the	
Pact, with respect for the division of competences	
between the various entities. A steering committee to	
monitor and support the Pact will be installed within	
the Chancellery (of the Prime Minister). The detailed	
rules will be defined in 2017 on the basis of a policy	
* · ·	
note.	

BG	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: - MIP: CSR 2, 3
	1. Achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,5 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017. Further improve tax collection and take measures to reduce the extent of the informal economy, including undeclared work.	Some progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact): The assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact will be made in spring when final data for 2016 will be available. Some progress in improving tax collection and reducing the extent of the informal economy. The government adopted in October 2015 the Single National Strategy (SNS) 2015-2017 for improving tax collection, tackling the shadow economy and reducing compliance costs. The implementation of the SNS and its accompanying action plan is ongoing with some of the measures already in place. Additional measures such as risk based controls on enterprises and enhanced controls on products subject to excise duties are also being implemented. Tax revenue is increasing and part of this increase can be attributed to improved collection, but the size of the shadow economy remains high. To tackle undeclared work the authorities have increased labour inspections but more effort seems to be needed in this area.	1. Further improve tax collection and tax compliance, including through a comprehensive set of measures beyond 2017. Step up enforcement of measures to reduce the extent of the informal economy, in particular undeclared work.
	2. By the end of 2016, finalise the asset quality review and stress test of the banks. By the end of 2016, complete the balance-sheet review and stress test of the insurance companies and the review of private pension funds' assets. Take, as necessary, follow-up actions in all three sectors and continue to improve banking and non-banking supervision.	Some progress: Some progress in finalising the asset quality review and stress test of the banks. The results of the review and stress tests were published but the degree of independence and the nature of the stress tests did not fully comply with the recommendation. Substantial progress in completing the balance-sheet review and stress test of the insurance companies and the review of private pension funds' assets. The reviews were completed to a high degree of independence and transparency. Some issues, including valuing illiquid	2. Take follow-up measures on the financial sector reviews, in particular concerning reinsurance contracts, group-level oversight, hard-to-value assets and related-party exposures. Improve banking and non-banking supervision through the implementation of comprehensive action plans, in close cooperation with European bodies. Facilitate the reduction of still high corporate non-performing loans, by drawing on a comprehensive set of tools, including by accelerating the reform of the insolvency framework and by promoting a functioning secondary market for non-performing loans.

financial instruments and assets as well as related-party transactions, were not fully tackled.

<u>Limited progress</u> in taking, as necessary, follow-up actions in all three financial sectors and in improving banking and non-banking supervision. The two supervisors have issued follow-up actions resulting from the reviews and stress tests. Those actions remain to be implemented. The BNB's action plan on banking supervision is being implemented albeit with delays in some important areas. The IMF/WB review is ongoing. Non-bank supervision remains to be improved by tackling the issues highlighted by the reviews.

3. Reinforce and integrate social assistance, including relevant social services, and active labour market policies, in particular for the long-term unemployed and young people not in employment, education or training. Increase the provision of quality education for disadvantaged groups, including Roma. Improve the efficiency of the health system by improving access and funding, and health outcomes. In consultation with social partners establish guidelines and criteria for setting the minimum wage. Increase the coverage and adequacy of the minimum income scheme.

Limited rogress:

Some progress in reinforcing and integrating social assistance, including relevant social services, and active labour market policies, in particular for the long-term unemployed and young people not in employment, education or training. Bulgaria initiated a pilot project to introduce integrated Centres for Employment and Social Assistance and plans to add 8 new centres in remote areas to the existing 65. Many unemployed have already been serviced by these centres. The working methods between the Employment Agency and Agency for Social Assistance have improved. However, there is a limited provision of social services to support the long term unemployed taking a job, as local municipalities - the main social services providers – have not been involved. Efforts to address the high percentage of young people not in employment, education or training have started yielding results as the implementation of the Youth Guarantee is speeding up. However employment indicators are still worrying. There are several projects at national level based on the plans of municipalities and funded by the European Social Fund which aim at providing integrated services for Roma, migrants and the disadvantaged, including employment, education, housing and social services. Many of those in target groups are long term unemployed.

3. Improve the targeting of active labour market policies and the integration between employment and social services for disadvantaged groups. Increase the provision of quality mainstream education, in particular for Roma. Increase health insurance coverage, reduce out-of-pocket payments and address shortages of healthcare professionals. In consultation with social partners, establish a transparent mechanism for setting the minimum wage. Improve the coverage and adequacy of the minimum income.

<u>Limited progress</u> in increasing the provision of quality education for disadvantaged groups, including Roma. Despite budgetary increases, ensuring the necessary funding for the ongoing reform is a challenge and the financial standard has not yet been adopted. School performance indicators and the methodology for funding based on performance have yet to be developed. The provision banning segregated classes within the same school/kindergarten needs to be properly implemented and monitored, but such mechanisms remain weak. Following the entry into force of the new School Education Act in August 2016, a new education standard will focus on intercultural education¹ and will be implemented for the first time this school year.

<u>Limited progress</u> in improving the efficiency of the health system by improving access and funding, and health outcomes. Most measures concerning pharmaceutical pricing which aim at reducing costs of medicines are not expected to go into force until the beginning of 2017 at the earliest. Others like contracting of hospital services based on the National Health Map are implemented only partially – contracts for hospitals until April 2017 were set based on historical data. A significant part of the population remains without health insurance coverage.

<u>Limited progress</u> in establishing guidelines and criteria for setting the minimum wage. Progress on devising a minimum wage setting mechanism is also limited; there seems to be general agreement among the government and social partners on the way forward, however this still needs to be put in practice.

<u>Limited progress</u> in increasing the coverage and adequacy of the minimum income scheme. It is now

¹ The adopted standard is less ambitious than initially planned as it includes 'Civic, health, environment and intercultural education' but it is still a step forward to a more inclusive and innovative methods of education. The programme is to be adopted by the schools depending on their needs. Center Amalipe has shared their experience in this respect and published guidance for schools on how to plan activities in this respect.

4. Reform the insolvency framework to accelerate recovery and resolution procedures and improve their effectiveness and transparency. Increase the capacity of the courts regarding insolvency procedures. Strengthen the capacity of the Public Procurement Agency and contracting authorities and improve the design and control of public tendering procedures, in particular by fully implementing the National Strategy for the development of the Public Procurement Sector (2014-2020). Speed up the introduction of e-procurement.

possible to apply for benefits irrespective of the place of residence. Earnings from one day and dual education contracts will be excluded from the means testing. Heating benefits for the 2016/2017 winter season were marginally increased. However, the extent of measures planned to increase the coverage and adequacy of the minimum income scheme does not correspond to the magnitude of poverty in the country and do not allow the benefits to keep their safety net function over time.

Limited progress:

<u>Limited progress</u> in reforming the insolvency framework to accelerate recovery and resolution procedures as well as improving their effectiveness and transparency as well as increasing the capacity of the courts regarding insolvency procedures. The insolvency reform effort has been slow despite the high level of private sector debt and mediocre performance of the insolvency proceedings framework. Improvement efforts in the legislative as well as judicial framework do not match the size of the problem. According to the assessment of the Commission, beyond the proper implementation of the announced initiatives, further steps are needed, in particular in the judicial system. Amendments to the Commerce Act and the Pledge Registry have only recently been adopted. They will need to be complemented with improvements in the infrastructure of the judicial system and in judges' capacity to handle insolvency cases.

Some progress in strengthening the capacity of the Public Procurement Agency and contracting authorities and improving the design and control of public tendering procedures [...] and limited progress in speeding up the introduction of e-procurement. A number of actions have already been undertaken by the Bulgarian government. However, the majority of them is currently at an early stage of implementation, so that their practical effects still need to be seen and assessed. The authorities have only started the tendering process for the e-procurement system.

4. Ensure efficient implementation of the 2014-2020 National Public Procurement Strategy.

CZ Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: - MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: - MIP: -
1. Take measures to ensure the long-term sustainability of public finances, in light of future risks in the area of healthcare. Adopt legislation to strengthen the fiscal framework.	Limited progress has been made in ensuring the long-term sustainability of public finance. Some measures in the healthcare sector are at various stages of adoption, including a draft law on using Pharmacy Cost-Based Groups to provide for a more equitable distribution of funds among health insurance companies. On the other hand, the government has approved a proposal to cap the retirement age at 65 after around 2030, which is likely to worsen the long-term sustainability of pensions. Substantial progress has been made on the adoption of the legislation to strengthen the fiscal framework. The proposed fiscal legislation to implement Directive 2011/85/EU on budgetary frameworks was approved by the parliament in January 2017.	1. Ensure the long-term sustainability of public finances, in view of the ageing population. Increase the effectiveness of public spending, notably by fighting corruption and inefficient practices in public procurement.
2. Reduce regulatory and administrative barriers to investment, in particular in transport and energy, and increase the availability of e-government services. Adopt the outstanding anti-corruption reforms and improve public procurement practices.	Limited progress has been achieved in reducing regulatory and administrative barriers to investment. With regards to energy investment, the use of EU funds for energy efficiency projects has been delayed. The administration of the related Operational Programmes is fragmented. To simplify and accelerate the permit procedure, the government has presented a draft amendment of the Construction Act, which is currently under discussion in the parliament. Limited progress has been achieved towards increasing the availability of e-government services. The measures taken are showing some results but most are still at an early stage of implementation or not yet initiated. Responsibility for the rollout of e-government services is	2. Remove obstacles to growth, in particular by streamlining procedures for granting building permits and further reducing the administrative burden on businesses, by rolling out key e-government services, by improving the quality of R&D and by fostering employment of underrepresented groups.

Some progress has been made towards adopting the outstanding anti-corruption reforms. The parliament adopted several laws, in particular the Act on Political Party Financing, the Conflict of Interest Law, the Act on Declaring the Origin of Property and the Public Procurement Act. However, several important measures from the anti-corruption plan for 2016 remain unimplemented. **Limited progress** has been made in improving public procurement practices. Despite the slightly delayed transposition of the modernised public procurement directives, no specific measures were announced to cope with the systemic shortcomings in the application of the public procurement legislation, in particular low use of quality criteria in tenders, unprofessionally prepared tender specifications, excessive use of negotiated procedures without prior publication and low use of aggregated procurement. Some progress: See CSR 2 (R&D, employment of under-represented 3. Strengthen governance in the R & D system and facilitate the links between academia and enterprises. groups) Limited progress has been made in strengthening Raise the attractiveness of the teaching profession and take measures to increase the inclusion of disadvantaged governance in the R&D system and facilitating the links between academia and enterprises. While progress has children, including Roma, in mainstream schools and pre-schools. Remove the obstacles to greater labour been observed in terms of developing a more comprehensive funding methodology, governance in the market participation by under-represented groups, in particular women. sense of a separate function to be provided by the government to all R&D bodies has not yet been sufficiently addressed. Further, cooperation between academia and enterprises has not yet been incorporated into the funding and evaluation framework. Substantial progress has been made in raising the attractiveness of the teaching profession by increasing teachers' salary by 8 % in September 2016. The government also adopted a new draft career system for teachers and pedagogical staff, the aim of which is to link professional development, career and remuneration.

Some progress has been made towards increasing the inclusion of disadvantaged children. The reform on inclusive education got underway in September 2016 which makes it too early to assess the impact. It aims to gradually increase the participation of pupils with special needs — including socially disadvantaged pupils — in mainstream education by granting them a legal right to individual support measures. Only a limited number of pupils have benefited from the reform to date. Aside from the absence of a piloting period, this may be partly due to the fact that the reform is being implemented gradually over a period of two years.

Some progress has been made in removing obstacles to greater labour market participation by under-represented groups, in particular women. Labour market participation of women improved in 2015, climbing up to 66.4 %. Proposed amendments to the Labour Code are aimed at strengthening both the flexibility of labour arrangements and the protection of employees. A proposed amendment to the law on social support makes the drawing of parental allowance more flexible. The implementation of ESF-supported projects creating new places in childcare facilities continues — almost 10 000 places have been created to date, while new 'micro-nurseries' are being piloted. A pilot project supporting job-related mobility of the long-term unemployed is being implemented.

DK	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CRS 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: - MIP: -
20 0,3 ob	Respect the medium-term budgetary objective in 016 and achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of ,25 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary bjective in 2017.	CSRs related to the compliance with the SGP will be assessed in spring once the final data will be available.	
in se in	Enhance productivity and private sector restment by increasing competition in the domestic ervices sector, in particular by facilitating market entry a retail and construction. Incentivise the cooperation etween businesses and universities.	Some progress has been made in enhancing productivity and private sector investment. On facilitating market access in retail: in January 2017 the government presented a proposal to the Parliament to amend the Planning Act. However, since this proposal has not yet been adopted, the assessment is limited progress. There was some progress on facilitating market access in construction, following the mapping of standards in 2015, the updating of the law on electrical installations in 2015, and the proposed amendments to the Building Regulation to simplify procedures. Some progress has been made on incentivising cooperation between businesses and universities: There is some initiative from the national authorities to strengthen the links between universities and the private sector through dialogues involving both parties, new guidelines and specific programmes that stimulate collaboration. These include notably the efforts of the Danish Agency for Science and Technology together with Universities Denmark, a more prominent role given to the research and technology organisations, and the new Innovation Fund Denmark created with the ambition of supporting investments and long-term projects/partnerships that involve research, technology, demonstration and market development activities. Moreover, the Ministry of Higher Education and Science in June 2016 renegotiated the university performance contracts for 2015-2017 which introduced an additional performance targets on regional knowledge transfer activities.	1. Foster competition in the domestically oriented services sector.

DE	

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: -MIP: CRS 1, 2, 3

1. Achieve a sustained upward trend in public investment, especially in infrastructure, education, research and innovation, while respecting the medium term objective. Improve the design of federal fiscal relations with a view to increasing public investment, especially at municipal level.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Some progress:

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in increasing investment in public infrastructure. The federal infrastructure plan 2030 announces significant increases in transport infrastructure investment. If implemented effectively, the planned transport infrastructure company could be a step forward in addressing the barriers to investment identified in last year's country report. Funds provided for investment in transport infrastructure in the federal budget have increased in recent years.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in increasing public expenditure on education and no additional measures have been taken in this regard. Despite more spending by the Federal Government, expenditure on education as a proportion of GDP at the level of general government has remained stable in recent years and well below the EU average. Overall public and private education and research expenditure has increased only slightly in recent years and may have fallen short of the national target of 10 % of GDP.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in increasing public expenditure on research and innovation and no additional measures have been taken in this regard. Public expenditure on R&D has remained stable at around 0.9 % of GDP in recent years and total public and private expenditure stabilised at around 2.9 % of GDP in 2014 and 2015.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in improving the scope for public investment, including at federal state and municipal level, though it remains to be seen to what extent this additional fiscal space will actually be used for more public investment.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: - MIP: CSR 1, 2

1. Use fiscal policy to support domestic demand and achieve a sustained upward trend in investment. Accelerate public investment at all levels of government, especially in education, research and innovation, and address capacity and planning constraints for infrastructure investments. Further improve the efficiency and investment-friendliness of the tax system. Stimulate competition in business services and regulated professions.

The Federal Government is further relieving federal states and municipalities of expenditure relating to asylum seekers and refugees and other social spending, which should increase their scope for public investment. The transfers to the federal states comprise an annual lump sum of EUR 2 billion over the period 2016-2018 through an equivalent increase in the federal states' share of joint VAT revenue. They also include compensation for the cost of accommodation allowances for those granted asylum, amounting to EUR 400 million in 2016, EUR 900 million in 2017 and EUR 1.3 billion in 2018. As of 2018, the municipalities will receive an additional EUR 5 billion of relief annually through a combination of a higher share of municipalities in joint VAT revenue and an increased federal contribution to the funding of the accommodation allowance for the long-term unemployed. In total, the relief planned for 2016 amounted to about 0.1 % of GDP (or 5.4 % of the gross fixed capital formation of the federal states and municipalities in 2015), rising to around 0.3 % of GDP (20 %) by 2018.

The planned reform of federal fiscal relations that will take effect in 2020 (see Box 4.4.3) should also improve the conditions for public investment at all levels of government. The adoption of the related constitutional changes and implementing legislation by both the Federal Parliament and the Federal Council representing the federal states is envisaged for spring 2017. The extra revenue allocated to the federal states - estimated at around EUR 9.7 billion in 2020 (0.3 % of 2015 GDP), rising to EUR 13 billion by 2030 - should increase the scope for public investment both at federal state and municipal level in the longer term. However, the reform falls short of more fundamental changes in terms of increasing the tax autonomy of federal states and municipalities, which could have further increased the scope for public investment. The planned federal transport infrastructure company could alleviate significant barriers to public infrastructure investment.

	The recent extension of the services of the existing	
	independent consulting firm (ÖPP Deutschland AG) that	
	promotes public private partnerships to include the whole	
	public sector should also boost the planning and	
	implementation of infrastructure investment, particularly	
	at municipal level.	
2. Reduce inefficiencies in the tax system, in part		See CSR 1 (reducing inefficiencies in the tax system,
by reviewing corporate taxation and the local trad		increasing competition in the services sector)
modernise the tax administration and review		increasing competition in the services sector)
regulatory framework for venture capital. Ste		
measures to stimulate competition in the ser		
sector, in particular in business services and reg		
professions.	for tax avoidance. Key elements are that public funds will	
professions.	be subject to corporate taxation, while the transparency	
	principle will be abolished. No measures have been taken	
	to review corporate taxation and the local trade tax.	
	to review corporate taxation and the local trade tax.	
	<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in modernising the tax	
	administration.	
	administration.	
	The law on modernising taxation procedures aims at	
	strengthening the automatic processing of tax returns.	
	Previous requirements to submit supporting documents	
	have largely been abolished. Combined with a stronger	
	emphasis on risk-based audits, this also prepares the	
	ground for a more efficient and effective tax	
	administration.	
	administration.	
	If implemented effectively, additional general and IT-	
	specific functional authority of the federal tax	
	administration in relation to the states' tax	
	administration in relation to the states tax administrations as agreed as part of the reform of federal	
	fiscal relations could facilitate an accelerated	
	modernisation of the tax administration.	
	Several additional measures to curb tax evasion and	
	avoidance have been proposed by the Federal	
	Government.	
	Same progress has been made in reviewing the	
	Some progress has been made in reviewing the regulatory framework for venture capital. The Federal	
	regulatory framework for venture capital. The Federal	

Government has adopted a draft law to improve the loss carry-forward for companies that have a change in shareholders but continue their core business. This is to facilitate access to venture capital for young and innovative companies, particularly in later start-up stages.

Step up measures to stimulate competition in the services sector, in particular in business services and regulated professions.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in stimulating competition in the services sector. The Federal Government plans some limited modifications for certain liberal professions and business services, partly in response to national court decisions having declared some existing regulations unlawful. This concerns the prohibition of medical doctors and lawyers on offering services in partnership and mandatory tariffs for tax advisers. However, there is no strategy to substantially modernise the regulated professions and to strengthen competition in the services sector.

3. Increase incentives for later retirement and reduce disincentives to work for second earners. Reduce the high tax wedge for low wage earners and facilitate the transition from mini-jobs to standard employment.

Limited progress:

Limited progress has been made in increasing incentives for later retirement. A law on facilitating the transition of older workers into retirement ('Flexi-Rente') has been adopted. It mainly aims to make the transition of older workers into retirement more flexible. In particular, the reform promotes the combination of early retirement and part-time work by reducing pension deductions in the event of extra income. It also incentivises employment above retirement age for employees by enabling them to acquire additional pension entitlements as well as for employers, by releasing them from the obligation to pay unemployment insurance contributions for employees above retirement age. It is too early to assess to what extent the reform may offset the stronger incentives for early retirement introduced by the last pension reform and the impact of an ageing population. Further assessment and monitoring appears required in this regard.

2. Reduce disincentives to work for second earners and facilitate transitions to standard employment. Reduce the high tax wedge for low-wage earners. Create conditions to promote higher real wage growth, respecting the role of the social partners.

<u>No progress</u> has been made in reducing disincentives to work for second earners. No initiatives have been taken or announced in this regard.

Limited progress has been made in reducing the high tax wedge for low-wage earners. The Federal Government adopted a package of measures aimed at safeguarding the minimum subsistence level and compensating for fiscal drag. The basic personal income tax allowance, the child allowance, the child benefit and the child supplement will be increased in 2017 and 2018 to align them with the adjusted subsistence level in accordance with existing law. Moreover, the income tax brackets will be adjusted to offset the impact of fiscal drag based on the tax progression report that is published every two years. These measures largely aim at adjusting for price developments and tend to benefit in particular low and middle income groups. However, only a limited impact on the tax wedge, if any, can be expected.

<u>No progress</u> has been made in facilitating the transition from mini-jobs to standard employment. No initiatives have been taken or announced in this regard.

EE	
	1 () () () () () () () () () (

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: -MIP: -

1. Ensure the provision and accessibility of highquality public services, especially social services, at local level, inter alia, by adopting and implementing the proposed local government reform. Adopt and implement measures to narrow the gender pay gap, including those foreseen in the Welfare Plan.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Some progress:

<u>Some progress</u> in ensuring the provision and accessibility of high-quality social services at local level. Implementation is ongoing for the Social Welfare Act and the measures under the 2016-2020 action plan for the 2016-2023 welfare development plan.

<u>Some progress</u> in adopting and implementing the local government reform. The Administrative Reform Act was adopted in July 2016. The voluntary merger of municipalities, lasting until the end of 2016 was successful, leading to an initial decrease in the number of municipalities from 213 to 100.

<u>Limited progress</u> in reducing the gender pay gap. The 2016-2023 welfare development plan and its 2016-2020 action plan were adopted in June 2016. One out of the plan's four main areas aims at ensuring equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities for men and women in all areas of society. Due to the late approvals, the progress on implementing specific measures to reduce the gender pay gap is delayed.

The amendments to the Gender Equality Act are expected to enable the Labour Inspectorate to monitor gender equality in the private sector. They are planned for March. Also important are changes to the parental leave system to improve flexibility and ensure more equal sharing of care responsibilities between women and men. The government discussed and gave political guidelines on the scope and timetable of the parental leave system on 26th January.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to remain at its medium-term budgetary objective in 2018. Ensure better adequacy of the social safety net. Take measures to reduce the gender pay gap, in particular by improving wage transparency and reviewing the parental leave system.

2. Promote private investment in research, development and innovation, including by strengthening cooperation between academia and businesses.

Some progress:

Private investment in R&D is bottoming out at 0.69 % GDP. Cooperation between businesses and academia remains weak. However, Estonia has made **some progress** in addressing the CSR:

At the end of 2016, Estonia had already selected ERDF operations worth EUR 277 million under the priority axis on research, technological development and innovation of the Operational Programme for Cohesion Policy Funds 2014-2020. This is equivalent to 43 % of the total ERDF budget (EUR 642 million) for the axis concerned. Estonia also finalised in 2016 the remaining legal acts for the activities under this axis.

In 2016, the government launched a business development programme for firms with high-growth potential, launched specific support for the public procurement of innovation and promoted the increased use of financial instruments. An 'Industrial Policy Green Book' is also being developed.

There will be further support to public research organisations for applied research and development of products in cooperation with business, in areas addressed by the smart specialisation strategy. Changes are being introduced to the baseline funding of public research organisations to provide incentives for contract research with business. The share of institutional funding and project-based financing for research will be gradually raised to 50/50 (under the ruling coalition agreement).

Specialised R&D civil servant profiles have been created in line ministries in 2016 under the 'RITA' programme. The aim is to help deliver R&D priorities closer to business needs in smart specialisation areas.

Finally, doctoral studies in cooperation with entreprises and support for business to participate in technology development centres and clusters are being implemented.

2. Promote private investment in research, technology and innovation, including by implementing measures for strengthening the cooperation between academia and businesses.



Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 3

1. Following the correction of the excessive deficit, achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,6 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017. Use windfall gains from strong economic and financial conditions, as well as from asset sales, to accelerate debt reduction. Reduce vulnerability to economic fluctuations and shocks, inter alia, by broadening the tax base. Enhance the quality of expenditure, particularly by increasing cost-effectiveness of healthcare and by prioritising government capital expenditure in R & D and in public infrastructure, in particular transport, water services and housing.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Some progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact):

The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in Spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

<u>Limited progress</u> in reducing the vulnerability to economic fluctuations and shocks. The announced establishment of a 'rainy-day fund', if appropriately designed, could provide a fiscal buffer during a future economic downturn. Together with the announced long-term target of 45 % for the debtto-GDP ratio, the fund could help to reduce vulnerability to economic fluctuations. However, in the short term, the Draft Budgetary Plan for 2017 has introduced a wide range of tax expenditure measures, including a tax rebate for first-time buyers of newly-built homes, and increases in tax credits for the self-employed and home carers. These are likely to narrow the income tax base, thereby increasing the exposure of public finances to shocks. This is in addition to the suspension of water charge payments earlier this year, and the decision to further delay, until November 2019, the revaluation of self-assessed property values used to calculate local property tax liabilities. In isolation, the phasing out of the Universal Social Charge will undermine the commitment to maintain a broad tax base.

<u>Some progress</u> in enhancing the quality of expenditure through a reform of the budgetary process. This can help to improve communication on expenditure targets, increase stakeholder engagement and harness public support to improve the quality of expenditure. A 'culture of spending' to, for example, increase responsibility across the public administration for assessing the efficiency and effectiveness of public expenditure is being developed. The roll-out of

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 3

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. Use any windfall gains, such as proceeds from asset sales, to accelerate the reduction of the general government debt ratio. Limit the scope and the number of tax expenditures and broaden the tax base.

activity-based funding, the development of new eHealth architecture, the streamlining of financial management and information systems and the new cost-saving deal with the pharmaceutical industry are also steps forward.

Some progress in prioritising government capital expenditure. Public expenditure marginally grew from EUR 814 million in 2014 to EUR 843 million in 2015. Specific R&D Programmes being funded by the Capital Plan include commitments in respect of Cycle 5 of the Programme for Research in Third Level Institutions. However, low public R&D intensity continues to cause concern (decreasing at 0.33 % GDP in 2015). According to the Draft Budgetary Plan for 2017, capital expenditure will increase by 9 % compared to 2016. Investment will focus primarily on social housing and education. Ireland is planning to increase public investment while rebalancing priorities between current and capital spending. On 19 July the government published a housing action plan involving the allocation of a further EUR 2.2 billion (approximately 40 % of total capital spending) to social housing over the next four years, in addition to the EUR 3.8 billion already committed by the last government. The action plan envisages an increase in social housing units by approximately 47 000 and an increase in housing output of around 25 000 per year. It aims to create a EUR 200 million Local Infrastructure Housing Activation Fund, which will contribute to contribute to the delivery of transport, water and other infrastructure essential to an increase in housing supply. The government proposes to expedite the development of a number of large urban sites with the capacity to deliver up to 20 000 new homes.

2. Expand and accelerate the implementation of activation policies to increase the work intensity of households and address the poverty risk of children. Pursue measures to incentivise employment by tapering the withdrawal of benefits and supplementary payments. Improve the provision of quality, affordable full-time childcare.

Some progress:

<u>Some progress</u> in increasing households work intensity. Labour activation programmes have been rolled out further but their effects have not yet been assessed by the government. New announced measures, such as 'Pathways to Work for Jobless Households', are likely to increase the work intensity of households.

2. Better target government expenditure, by prioritising public investment in transport, water services, and innovation in particular in support of SMEs. Enhance social infrastructure, including social housing and quality childcare; deliver an integrated package of activation policies to increase employment prospects of low-skilled people and to address low work intensity of households.

Some progress in reducing child poverty. The government continues to implement previous measures but child benefit remains at EUR 140 per month. The benefits for lone parents is envisaged to increase from 2017. Some progress in incentivising employment. The Back to Work Family Dividend, set up in 2015, currently reaches 21 000 dependent young people. Budget 2017 announced additional funding for the Housing Assistance Payment, which is designed to tackle work disincentives arising from housing subsidies for the unemployed. This support is expected to reach an additional 15 000 people. Some progress in improving childcare provision. Ireland has taken steps to make childcare more affordable and improve its quality, but sustained efforts are needed over coming years to meet existing needs, especially among disadvantage families. Measures are also underway to improve the quality of childcare provision. 3. Finalise durable restructuring solutions to lower Some progress: 3. Encourage a more durable reduction in nonnon-performing loans, to ensure debt sustainability of performing loans through resolution strategies that households and to encourage lenders to reduce the debt involve write-offs for viable businesses and households, **Some progress** in adopting restructuring solutions of excessively leveraged yet viable businesses. sustainable in the long term. As the overall level of nonwith a special emphasis on resolving long-term arrears. performing decreases, the more difficult long-term arrears Accelerate the phasing-in of a fully operational cases make up an increasingly higher share of the remaining central credit registry covering all categories of lenders and debtors. stock. Repossessions remain low and the legal route lengthy. Following a pilot phase, the Money Advice and Budgeting Service for distressed debtors was launched nationally. In the first couple of months it registered significant interest, with over 2 800 free advice vouchers given out, of which the majority were used for financial counselling. **Some progress** in phasing-in the central credit registry. The consultation with the data Protection Commissioner has been concluded the regulations published by the Central Bank of Ireland. However, delays in implementing the central credit register mean that it will not be fully operational until late 2018.

EL	Country Specific Recommendations 2016	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017
	To avoid duplication with measures set out in the		To avoid duplication with measures set out in the
	Economic Adjustment Programme, there are no		Economic Adjustment Programme, there are no
	additional recommendations for Greece.		additional recommendations for Greece.

ES	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3
	1. Ensure a durable correction of the excessive deficit, in accordance with the relevant decisions or recommendations under the excessive deficit procedure, by taking the necessary structural measures and by using all windfall gains for deficit and debt reduction. Implement at all government levels the tools set out in the fiscal framework law. Enhance control mechanisms for public procurement and coordination of procurement policies across government levels.	Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact): Some progress has been made to strengthen Spain's fiscal framework. The updated DBP for 2017 reports that the government will assess, with the assistance of regional and local governments, the Stability law's spending rule, with a view to removing inconsistencies with the SGP spending rule, without however, providing details and a timeline. The government has implemented in 2017 some provisions set out in Spain's Stability law that had never been implemented —such as the requirement to adopt cuts in expenditure appropriations for public administrations at risk of non-compliance with the fiscal targets. However, the government has disclosed no measures to further increase the automaticity of the Stability Law's mechanisms to prevent and correct deviations from the deficit, debt and expenditure targets. Limited progress has been made to strengthen Spain's public procurement policy framework. The updated 2017 DBP includes measures that can go some way towards improving some public procurement practices in Spain. However, they do not address the need for a consistent	1. Ensure compliance with the Council decision of 8 August 2016 giving notice under the excessive deficit procedure, including also measures to strengthen the fiscal and public procurement frameworks. Undertake a comprehensive expenditure review in order to identify possible areas for improving spending efficiency.
		framework that ensures sufficient transparency and coordination of public procurement across all contracting authorities and entities. Furthermore, the reported measures do not spell out clear objectives for public procurement, instruments for action and a timeline for	
	2. Take further measures to improve labour market integration, by focusing on individualised support and strengthening the effectiveness of training measures. Enhance the capacity of regional employment services and reinforce their coordination with social services.	their adoption and implementation. Some progress: In 2016 Spain adopted the three-year Joint Action Plan to enhance the assistance to long-term unemployed, aimed at strengthening the employment services' capacity to	2. Reinforce the coordination between regional employment services, social services and employers, to better respond to jobseekers' and employers' needs. Take measures to promote hiring on open-ended contracts. Address regional disparities and

Address gaps and disparities in minimum income schemes and improve family support schemes, including access to quality childcare and long-term care.

provide individualised support for long-term unemployed. The Protocols to develop the Common Employment Services Portfolio are being developed.

Some progress has been made in improving labour market integration by focusing on individualised support. The Joint Action Plan to enhance the assistance to long-term unemployed lays down a limit of 120 beneficiaries per caseworker. Caseworkers should design an individualised pathway based on the profile of the unemployed, for which a profiling tool is being developed.

Spain has made <u>some progress</u> in enhancing the capacity of regional employment services. The Joint Action Plan to enhance the assistance to long-term unemployed provides for EUR 515 million for 2016-2018. In 2016 Spain has finalised an evaluation of the regional employment services (EVADES), whose conclusions have not been translated into concrete action so far. There has been no significant action to reinforce coordination between the public employment and social services.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in addressing gaps and disparities in minimum income schemes and improving family support schemes. The government will analyse the findings and recommendations of the in-depth evaluation of income guarantee systems and will work with the regions to improve the effectiveness of the schemes. In the area of long-term care some progress was made in terms of provision of services. The government plans to improve the conditions for access to the services, notably by simplifying the categories of dependency.

improve family support, including access to quality childcare. Increase labour market relevance of tertiary education. Address regional disparities in educational outcomes, notably by strengthening teachers' training and individual students' support.

fragmentation in income guarantee schemes and

3. Take further measures to improve the labour market relevance of tertiary education, including by incentivising cooperation between universities, firms and research institutions. Increase performance-based funding of public research bodies and universities and foster R&I investment by the private sector.

Limited progress:

<u>Limited progress</u> was made as regards measures to foster public-private cooperation in research and innovation. There is no strategic approach to knowledge transfer. Only a few punctual measures have been taken: creation of a working groups with chambers of commerce; establishment of a new technological 6 years-

3. Ensure adequate and sustained investment in research and innovation and strengthen its governance across government levels. Ensure a thorough and timely implementation of the law on market unity for existing and forthcoming legislation.

	term; creation of an industrial PhD scheme; tax incentives for companies hiring researchers. Limited progress made towards increasing performance-based funding of public research bodies and universities, and on fostering R&I investment by the private sector. The valuable initiatives under the "institutional strengthening" pillar of the National Plan for R&I can be a stepping stone for the further reinforcement of performance-based funding.	
4. Accelerate the implementation of the law on market unity at regional level. Ensure implementation by the autonomous regions of the reform measures adopted for the retail sector. Adopt the planned reform on professional services and associations.	Limited progress: Limited progress has been made on the implementation of the market unity law at regional level, judging from the pace of adaptation of sectorial regulation to the principles of the law on market unity and from the number of agreements reached between the central and regional governments at sectorial conference level to develop regulatory frameworks adapted to that law, since the publication of the 2016 Country Report for Spain. Moreover, some regulations adopted by regions in the area of the collaborative economy may be contrary to the principles of the market unity law. Limited progress has been made on implementing the retail sector reform, as only some regions have adopted implementing measures. No progress has been made on reforming professional services. Spain has neither announced nor adopted any measures in this area in 2016.	See CSR 3 (law on market unity)

FR				

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

1. Ensure a durable correction of the excessive deficit by 2017 by taking the required structural measures and by using all windfall gains for deficit and debt reduction. Specify the expenditure cuts planned for the coming years and step up efforts to increase the amount of savings generated by the spending reviews, including on local government spending, by the end of 2016. Reinforce independent public policy evaluations in order to identify efficiency gains across all sub-sectors of general government.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact):

The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in reinforcing the identification of savings and efficiency gains generated by the spending reviews and public policy evaluations. The savings made following the spending reviews in the PLF 2017 total EUR 400 million, which is a small amount given the structural efforts required. Also, the second wave of spending reviews has not resulted in any proposed savings. A number of further public policy evaluations were launched and a meta-evaluation is ongoing.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4

1. Ensure compliance with the Council recommendation of 10 March 2015 under the excessive deficit procedure. Thereafter, pursue fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of France's public finances. Comprehensively review expenditure items with the aim to make efficiency gains that translate into expenditure savings.

2. Ensure that the labour cost reductions are sustained and that minimum wage developments are consistent with job creation and competitiveness. Reform the labour law to provide more incentives for employers to hire on open-ended contracts.

Substantial progress:

Substantial progress has been made in ensuring that labour cost reductions are sustained. The second phase of reductions in employers' social security contributions planned under the solidarity and responsibility pact started in April 2016, after the first phase introduced in 2015. In addition, the government has increased the tax credit for competitiveness and employment (CICE) from 6 % to 7 %. The 2016 national reform programme announced that the CICE would be transformed into permanent reductions in employers' social security contributions by 2018, but no details are available at the moment.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in ensuring that changes in the minimum wage are consistent with job creation and competitiveness. The minimum wage followed its

2. Consolidate the measures reducing the cost of labour to maximise their efficiency in a budget neutral manner and in order to scale up their effects on employment and investment. Broaden the overall tax base and take further action to implement the planned decrease in the corporate income statutory rate.

	indexation rule, leading to a 0.6 % increase on 1 January 2016. No intent to review the indexation mechanism has been expressed by the government. Substantial progress has been made in reforming the labour law. The El Khomri law on labour, social dialogue and professional pathways was adopted in July 2016. However, its final effect will depend on its full implementation and on social partners taking ownership of the flexibility the law offers. The reform of Labour Courts introduced by the 2015 Macron law was completed with the adoption, in November 2016, of a decree reviewing the indicative ceilings for unjustified individual dismissals.	
3. Improve the links between the education sector and the labour market, in particular by reforming apprenticeships and vocational training, with emphasis on the low-skilled. By the end of 2016, take action to reform the unemployment benefit system in order to bring the system back to budgetary sustainability and to provide more incentives to return to work.	Some progress has been made in improving the links between the education sector and the labour market. The implementation of the 2014 vocational training reform is ongoing. Apprenticeship figures stopped decreasing in 2015. The El Khomri labour law introduces a new personal activity account (CPA), entering into force in January 2017. It mostly reinforces training rights for non-qualified active workers. No progress has been made in reforming the unemployment benefit system. Social partners failed to agree on a new unemployment benefit convention in July, leading to an extension of the current 2014 convention. The timeline for adopting a reform of the unemployment benefit system is not clear yet.	3. Improve the access to the labour market for jobseekers, notably the less qualified workers and people with a migrant background, including by revising the system of vocational education and training. Ensure that minimum wage developments are consistent with job creation and competitiveness.
4. Remove barriers to activity in the services sector, in particular in business services and regulated professions. Take steps to simplify and improve the efficiency of innovation policy schemes. By the end of 2016, further reform the size-related criteria in regulations that impede companies' growth and continue to simplify companies' administrative, fiscal and accounting rules by pursuing the simplification programme.	Some progress: Some progress has been made regarding the removal of barriers to activity in the regulated professions through sectoral legislation, notably the Loi Macron and the Loi Santé. France has adopted almost all the secondary legislation needed to implement provisions on liberalisation of professions that were not directly applicable. In other fields where reforms of the service sector were adopted in 2015 (e.g. home-care services),	4. Further reduce the regulatory burden for firms, including by pursuing the simplification programme. Continue to lift barriers to competition in the services sector, including in business services and regulated professions. Simplify and improve the efficiency of public support schemes for innovation.

the legal framework was completed in 2016 and awaits implementation by local authorities. However, the ambition of measures to increase competition in regulated professions is lower than initially announced, mainly because of the implementation measures (for instance, as regards notaries). Some steps have also been taken to introduce competition in regional rail transport services for passengers on an experimental basis.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made to simplify and improve the efficiency of innovation policy schemes. While no recent measures have been adopted in this area, clear action to systematically evaluate innovation policy has been promoted in recent year(s), in particular by the National Commission for the Evaluation of Innovation Policies together with France Stratégie. These efforts include the evaluation of individual schemes (e.g. the CIR), and of the efficiency of the innovation policy as a whole. How these evaluations will be translated into policy practice is still to be seen.

<u>No progress</u> to reform the size-related criteria in social and tax legislation has been made, as no new measures have been adopted in this area since the end of 2015.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made to simplify companies' administrative, fiscal and accounting rules. The simplification programme is ongoing and encompasses new measures, but its implementation is slow. The 'Sapin II law' makes it easier for certain small companies to switch legal status, while it facilitates business creation by easing training requirements prior to starting a business and by removing the requirement for microentrepreneurs to open a second bank account at least during the first year of business.

5. Take action to reduce the taxes on production and the corporate income statutory rate while broadening the tax base on consumption, in particular as regards VAT. Remove inefficient tax expenditures, remove taxes that are yielding little or no revenue and adopt the withholding personal income tax reform by the end of 2016.

Limited progress:

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in reducing taxes on production and the corporate income. The last tranche of the turnover tax (C3S) has not been abolished and still weighs on 20 000 businesses. The statutory rate of corporate income tax will only be reduced to 28 % in 2017 for SMEs up to EUR 75 000 of profits. The objective of setting this rate at 28 % across the board by 2020 still stands. No progress on broadening the tax base on consumption, as the 2017 finance law does not remove or limit the use of reduced rates on VAT.

Some progress has been made in modernising the tax system. The withholding tax reform for personal income tax has been adopted by Parliament and will be introduced by 2018. However, tax expenditures keep increasing in number and in value and have exceeded the ceiling set in the 2014-2019 multiannual budgetary framework. In 2017, 14 new tax expenditures will be introduced while only 4 are to be suppressed and 5 come to an end. The removal of taxes yielding little or no revenue is progressing at a very slow pace.

See CSR 2 (broadening of the overall tax base, reduction in the corporate income statutory rate)

HR
6000
- 88
*

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1

MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

1. Ensure a durable correction of the excessive deficit by 2016. Thereafter, achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of at least 0,6 % of GDP in 2017. Use any windfall gains to accelerate the reduction of the general government debt ratio. By September 2016, reinforce numerical fiscal rules and strengthen the independence and the mandate of the Fiscal Policy Commission. By the end of 2016, improve budgetary planning and strengthen the multi-annual budgetary framework. By the end of 2016, start a reform of recurrent taxation of immovable property. Reinforce the framework for public debt management. Adopt and start implementing a debt management strategy for 2016-2018.

Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact):

<u>Limited progress</u> in reinforcing numerical fiscal rules and strengthening the independence and the mandate of the Fiscal Policy Commission. While a new draft of the fiscal responsibility act and budget act were prepared, they have still not been adopted.

<u>Limited progress</u> in improving budgetary planning and strengthen the multi-annual budgetary framework.

<u>Some progress</u> in reforming recurrent property taxation. The authorities have introduced a simple recurrent real estate tax through amendments to the law on local taxes. The tax will enter into force as of 2018.

<u>Some progress</u> regarding public debt management, related to the adopted debt management strategy, which covers the 2017-2019 period.

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to remain at its medium-term budgetary objective in 2018. By September 2017, reinforce budgetary planning and the multi-annual budgetary framework, including by strengthening the independence and mandate of the Fiscal Policy Commission. Take the necessary steps for the introduction of the value based property tax. Reinforce the framework for public debt management, including by ensuring annual updates of the debt management strategy.

2. By the end of 2016, take measures to discourage early retirement, accelerate the transition to the higher statutory retirement age, and align pension provisions for specific categories with the rules of the general scheme. Provide appropriate up- and re-skilling measures to enhance the employability of the workingage population, with a focus on the low-skilled and the long-term unemployed. Consolidate social protection benefits, including special schemes, by aligning eligibility criteria and integrating their administration, and focus support on those most in need.

No progress:

No progress in reforming the pension system Announced measures encouraging longer working lives and streamlining pension provisions have not been implemented. The authorities have completed a review of the arduous or hazardous professions benefiting from more generous pension provisions. However, the planned streamlining has not yet taken place.

<u>Limited progress</u> in providing up- and re-skilling measures. The programme for developing vocational education training has been adopted and new legislation is being prepared to improve adult learning. However, the

2. Discourage early retirement, accelerate the transition to the higher statutory retirement age, and align pension provisions for specific categories with the rules of the general scheme. Improve coordination and transparency of social benefits.

scope of training actions provided by the Public Employment Services seems inadequate in view of the size of the challenge. There are no significant developments on recognition of skills and validation of non-formal and informal learning.

No progress in improving the social protection system. The action plan setting out the reform priorities has not yet been adopted. The authorities have completed the analysis of benefits granted at central government level with a view to categorising them and harmonising eligibility criteria. The planned introduction of meanstesting for the child allowance is currently being reviewed. The establishment of one-stop shops to administer and provide social services is being postponed for the second time in a year. This has delayed the implementation of all the related reform measures.

3. By the end of 2016, start reducing fragmentation and improving the functional distribution of competencies in public administration to improve efficiency and reduce territorial disparities in the delivery of public services. In consultation with social partners, harmonise the wage-setting frameworks across the public administration and public services. Advance the divestment process of state assets and reinforce the monitoring of state-owned enterprises' performance and boards' accountability, including by advancing the listing of shares of state-owned companies.

Limited progress:

Limited progress in reforming the public administration. The main pillars of the reform have all been postponed due to lack of political commitment. In December 2016 the government adopted a new version of the 2017-2020 action plan for the modernisation of the public administration. New legislation redefining the division of tasks between the central and local state administration offices was due to be adopted in December 2016 but is still under preparation. There is no clear timetable for the plan to reduce the over 1 200 local branches of central administration offices by 20 %. The planned harmonisation and rationalisation of the state agencies system has been put on hold.

No progress in harmonising the wage-setting frameworks. The adoption of new legislation on public sector wages has been postponed by two years, to the end of 2019. Preparatory work has been carried out to develop an IT system to support the introduction of a universal system of wage grades. The authorities have also developed common guidelines for the negotiation, coordination and monitoring of collective agreements in

4. Reduce the fragmentation and improve the functional distribution of competencies in public administration, while enhancing the efficiency and reducing territorial disparities in the delivery of public services. In consultation with social partners, harmonise the wage-setting frameworks across the public administration and public services.

See CSR 5 (divestment process of state assets and reinforce the monitoring of state-owned enterprises' performance)

	the public administration. As far as state-owned	
	enterprises are concerned, no further steps have been	
	taken in setting up a coordinated system for collective bargaining.	
	barganning.	
	<u>Limited progress</u> in improving performance monitoring	
	and corporate governance of state owned enterprises, and	
	in divestment from state assets. Eight companies were	
	removed from the government's list of companies and other legal entities of strategic and special interest,	
	whereas the sale of stakes in non-strategic companies	
	yielded income of 0.2 % of GDP in 2016.	
4. Significantly reduce parafiscal charges. Remove	Limited progress:	5. Speed up the divestment of State-owned enterprises
unjustified regulatory restrictions hampering access to		and other State assets, and improve corporate
and the practice of regulated professions. Reduce the	<u>Limited progress</u> in reducing parafiscal charges. The	governance in the State-owned enterprise sector.
administrative burden on businesses.	authorities have decreased or cut only five parafiscal charges, with an impact significantly lower than planned	Significantly reduce the burden on businesses stemming from costs of regulation and from
	in the national reform programme.	administrative burdens. Remove regulatory
	in the national resonant programme.	restrictions hampering access to and the practice of
	<u>Limited progress</u> in removing regulatory restrictions in	regulated professions and professional and business
	regulated professions. An action plan was submitted in	services. Improve the quality and efficiency of the
	July 2016, but it entails only limited reform proposals and does not provide details on the substance of the	justice system, in particular by reducing the length in civil and commercial cases.
	amendments. For a number of professions, the action	civii and commercial cases.
	plan states that current regulation is adequate and no	
	modification is needed.	
	<u>Limited progress</u> in reducing the administrative burden.	
	An action plan for the reduction of administrative burden	
	was adopted by the government.	
5. Take measures to improve the quality and efficiency	Limited progress:	See CSR 5 (the quality and efficiency of the judicial
of the judicial system in commercial and administrative	I imited announced in immunity the institution of the	system)
courts. Facilitate the resolution of non-performing loans, in particular by improving the tax treatment of the	<u>Limited progress</u> in improving the justice system. The number of pending cases and length of court proceedings	
resolution of non-performing loans.	remain among the highest in the EU. Few measures have	
to non paratimes to and	been implemented to improve the efficiency of justice	
	(e.g. limited introduction of case management reforms)	
	and it will take time for the implemented judicial map	
	reform to show effects. Improving the quality of the justice system remains a challenge, particularly the	
	electronic communication with courts, where no	
	ciccionic communication with courts, where no	

measures have been implemented that would allow public bodies, parties and legal professionals to send and receive court documents in electronic form.	
Some progress in facilitating the resolution of non-performing loans, as sales accelerate. The recent tax reform's provisions on deductibility of non-performing loan write-offs may facilitate a faster resolution in 2017.	
	3. Improve adult education, in particular of older workers, the low-skilled, and the long-term unemployed. Accelerate the reform of the education system.



Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

1. In 2016, limit the temporary deviation from the required 0,5 % of GDP adjustment towards the medium-term budgetary objective to the amount of 0,75 % of GDP allowed for investments and the implementation of structural reforms, subject to the condition of resuming the adjustment path towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2017. Achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,6 % or more of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in **2017.** Finalise the reform of the budgetary process in the course of 2016 and ensure that the spending review is an integral part of it. Ensure the timely implementation of the privatisation programme and use the windfall gains to accelerate the reduction of the general government debt ratio. Shift the tax burden from productive factors onto consumption and property. Reduce the number and scope of tax expenditures and complete the reform of the cadastral system by mid-2017. Take measures to improve tax compliance, including through electronic invoicing and payments.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Some progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact):

The assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact will be made in Spring.

<u>Substantial progress</u> has been made in reforming the budgetary process. A comprehensive reform of the process was passed in 2016. Its full implementation is expected in the 2018 Budget Law, which would make the spending review a more integral part of the budgeting process.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in implementing the privatisation programme and in using the windfall gains to reduce public debt. In 2016, Italy has underachieved its privatisation targets (at 0.1 % of GDP in 2016 versus the planned 0.5 %) and the lower interest rate expenditure was counterbalanced by increased primary expenditure.

Some progress has been made in shifting the tax burden from productive factors onto consumption and property. Italy's 2017 Budget Law contains several measures affecting the tax wedge on labour, including lower tax rates on productivity premia agreed in decentralised bargaining, an exemption from the payment of social security contributions for certain new hires, and the reduction of the social security contributions rate for the self-employed. These measures compound more sizeable measures taken in 2014 and 2015 to reduce the labour tax wedge.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in reducing the number and scope of tax expenditures and in completing the reform of the cadastral system.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of Italy's public finances. Shift the tax burden from the factors of production onto taxes less detrimental to growth in a budgetary neutral way by taking decisive action to reduce the number and scope of tax expenditures, reforming the outdated cadastral system and reintroducing the first residence tax for highincome households. Broaden the compulsory use of electronic invoicing and payments.

2. Implement the reform of the public administration by adopting and implementing all necessary legislative decrees, in particular those reforming publicly-owned enterprises, local public services and the management of human resources. Step up the fight against corruption including by revising the statute of limitations by the end of 2016. Reduce the length of civil justice proceedings by enforcing reforms and through effective casemanagement.	Limited progress has been made in improving tax compliance. The 2017 Budget Law introduces a new tax on business income (IRI) to harmonise the tax system of small firms and corporations. It also introduces transparency provisions on the communication of invoices and VAT data, and a reform of tax administration, merging the tax-recovery agency (Equitalia) with the revenue agency. Sanctions and fines related to unpaid taxes in 2000-2015 are waived for taxpayers spontaneously regularising their tax position. Limited progress Limited progress Limited progress has been made in implementing the public administration reform. Several implementing decrees have been adopted. However, on 25 November 2016, the Constitutional Court ruled that the procedure envisaged was unconstitutional for the decrees pointed out in the recommendations, notably those concerning human resource management, local public services and publicly-owned enterprises. Some of them had been already adopted (those regulating the management level in the health sector, disciplinary dismissals and state-owned enterprises) and have therefore to be amended. For two decrees, (on local public services and public managers), the delegation had already expired. The decree on non-managerial staff was also concerned, but it can still be adopted under the enabling law with the correct procedure. No progress has been made in revising the statute of limitations. Some progress has been made in enforcing civil justice reform and improving case-management but the length	2. Reduce the trial length in civil justice through effective case management and rules ensuring procedural discipline. Step up the fight against corruption, in particular by revising the statute of limitations. Complete reforms of public employment and improve the efficiency of publicly-owned enterprises. Promptly adopt and implement the pending law on competition and address the remaining restrictions to competition.
	of proceedings is not decreasing.	
3. Accelerate the reduction in the stock of non- performing loans, including by further improving the framework for insolvency and debt collection. Swiftly complete the implementation of ongoing corporate governance reforms in the banking sector.	Some progress: Limited progress has been made in reducing non-performing loans (NPLs). In April 2016, a law was passed creating an NPL securitisation scheme supported	3. Accelerate the reduction in the stock of non- performing loans and step up incentives for balance- sheet clean-up and restructuring, in particular in the segment of banks under national supervision. Adopt a comprehensive overhaul of the regulatory framework
governance reforms in the banking sector.	by state guarantees (GACS), which became operational	for insolvency and collateral enforcement.

in August 2016 with the adoption of an implementing decree. Since April 2016, two private-sector backstop funds (Atlante I and II) have been set up to support the recapitalisation and the impaired asset disposal of vulnerable banks. Furthermore, the Bank of Italy has issued a new reporting template requiring banks to provide detailed data on their bad loans, collateral and ongoing recovery procedures. Although all these measures — including several reforms of insolvency and collateral enforcement rules — are in principle helpful in fostering the development of a secondary market for distressed assets in Italy, they have not yet resulted in significant short-term relief for the banking sector. In December 2016, the government approved the setup of a EUR 20 billion fund for the precautionary recapitalisation of and liquidity support for vulnerable banks, but it is not yet clear whether this will be a turningpoint in the clean-up of the Italian banking sector.

Some progress has been made in improving the framework for insolvency and debt collection. In June 2016, further changes to Italy's insolvency and collateral enforcement rules were made. Inter alia, provisions authorise private enforcement clauses in loan contracts allowing creditors to take ownership of collateral out-ofcourt in the event of a debtor's default (patto marciano), and enable entrepreneurs to pledge movable assets while continuing to use them (a kind of non-possessory lien). Furthermore, an electronic register for insolvency cases will be set up, and hearings can now be held electronically. The reforms complement those of 2015, but it may take some time before their results in terms of shorter proceedings and higher recovery values essential for NPL market activity — materialise. In the meantime, a draft enabling law aiming to fundamentally overhaul the insolvency and enforcement framework is currently under parliamentary discussion.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in implementing corporate governance reform. With the adoption of a law in April 2016 and implementing provisions by the Bank

	of Italy in November 2016, the 18-month implementation period started for the self-reform of the segment of small mutual banks (banche di credito cooperativo (BCCs)). BCCs wishing to retain their cooperative status will have to join one of the cooperative banking groups that will be set up, and their relationship with the group's holding company will be determined by risk-based 'cohesion contracts'. The implementation of the 2015 reforms of large cooperative banks (banche popolari) and bank foundations has continued, although legal challenges and unfavourable market conditions have led to some delays.	
4. Implement the reform of active labour market policies, in particular by strengthening the effectiveness of employment services. Facilitate the take-up of work for second earners. Adopt and implement the national antipoverty strategy and review and rationalise social spending.	Some progress: Some progress has been made in implementing the reform of ALMPs. The new Agency in charge of active labour market policies (ANPAL) is operational as of January 2017. A pilot outplacement voucher (assegno di ricollocazione) scheme was launched in November 2016 covering a sample of 30 000 beneficiaries. Limited progress has been made in facilitating the take-up of work by second earners. The 2017 Budget Law extends paternity leave from two to four days as of 2018. It also extends to 2017 and 2018 the possibility, first introduced in 2012, to exchange parental leave with babysitting vouchers and introduces a non-means-tested voucher for EUR 1 000 per year to be spent in public or private nurseries. Some progress has been made with regard to the national antipoverty strategy. The active inclusion measure (SIA),	4. With the involvement of social partners, strengthen the collective bargaining framework to allow collective agreements to better take into account local conditions. Ensure effective active labour market policies. Facilitate the take-up of work for second earners. Rationalise social spending and improve its composition.
	which provides economic and social care to disadvantaged households, was rolled out at national level. An enabling law aimed at establishing a single comprehensive scheme against poverty, replacing SIA and the unemployment assistance scheme (ASDI), has been approved by the Chamber of Deputies.	

5. Swiftly adopt and implement the pending law on	Limited progress:	See CSR 2 (implementation of the law on competition)
competition. Take further action to increase competition		
in regulated professions, the transport, health and retail	No progress has been made with regard to the pending	
sectors and the system of concessions.	law on competition. The draft law was presented to	
	Parliament in April 2015 and has not yet been approved	
	by the Senate.	
	<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in addressing	
	remaining barriers to competition in regulated	
	professions, the transport, health and retail sectors and	
	the system of concessions. The code for public	
	procurement and concessions was revised in 2016. No	
	further measures were taken to remove remaining	
	barriers to competition in the other sectors.	

CY

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

1. Following the correction of the excessive deficit, respect the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017. By the end of 2016, adopt a binding mechanism containing the growth rate of the compensation of public employees. By the end of 2016, adopt the horizontal reform of the public administration and the law on the governance of state-owned entities, and implement the reform of local governments. By the end of 2016, adopt the secondary legislation to complete the new budgetary framework.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress in addressing CSR 1 despite the completion of the budgetary framework. Indeed, limited progress has been made to adopt the draft bills regarding the wage bill while no progress was made concerning the public administration reform. No progress was made regarding the reform of state owned enterprises and local government, which related bills are still pending adoption by the House of Representatives.

The assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in spring 2017, when final data for 2016 will be available

There has been <u>limited progress</u> with regard to the binding mechanism containing the growth rate of the compensation of public employees. The mechanism has been introduced until 2018 in collective agreements with public sector unions. However, the legislative proposal to make this mechanism permanent has been rejected by the House of Representatives.

There has been <u>no progress</u> with regard to the horizontal reform of the public administration. The draft laws have been rejected by the House of Representatives.

There has been **no progress** with regard to the law on the governance of state-owned entities, and the reform of local governments. These reforms have not yet been adopted by the House of Representatives.

There has been <u>substantial progress</u> as the legislation to complete the new budgetary framework has been adopted by the House of Representatives but implementation steps are still missing for it to be effective.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to remain at its medium-term budgetary objective in 2018. By end-2017, adopt key legislative reforms aiming to improve efficiency in the public sector, notably on the functioning of public administration, governance of State-owned entities and local governments.

2. By June 2017, eliminate impediments to the full implementation of the insolvency and foreclosure frameworks and ensure adequate resources for the Insolvency Service. Ensure reliable and swift systems for the issuance of title deeds and the transfer of immovable property rights. Increase the efficiency and capacity of the court system. Reform the civil procedure law.

Cyprus has made **limited progress** with regard to CSR 2 on implementation of the insolvency and foreclosure frameworks and improving the title deeds issuance and transfer system. Some measures have been announced but remain to be adopted, while no full review of the insolvency and foreclosure frameworks, nor title deeds reform legislation have been tabled.

There has been **some progress** in eliminating barriers to fully implementing the insolvency and foreclosure frameworks and in ensuring adequate resources for the Insolvency Service. Necessary amendments to the legislation on insolvency have been identified but not yet drafted, and no timetable has been released for their submission to the House of Representatives. Rules of Court have been adopted for personal insolvency procedures and are being prepared for corporate insolvency procedures. The capacity of the Insolvency Service has been increased. The foreclosure infrastructure has been developed.

There has been <u>limited progress</u> on ensuring reliable and swift systems for issuing title deeds and transferring immovable property rights. Administrative and legislative measures have been taken to facilitate the issuance of title deeds, but no draft legislation for transfer of title deeds has been prepared due to the lack of understanding and agreement among stakeholders.

There has been <u>limited progress</u> on increasing the efficiency and capacity of the court system and reforming the civil procedure law, as several reform initiatives have been announced but remain at a preliminary stage.

3. By the end of 2016, take additional measures to ensure a decline in non-performing loans and accurate valuations of collateral for provisioning purposes. Increase the range of information available for creditors and enhance the information currently provided to make the credit registry fully effective.

There has been **some progress** overall on CSR 3, regarding measures to ensure a decline in non-performing loans and increase the range of information available for creditors through the credit registry, which is now fully operational for loan origination purposes.

2. Increase the efficiency of the judicial system by modernising civil procedures, implementing appropriate information systems and increasing the specialisation of courts. Take additional measures to eliminate impediments to the full implementation of the insolvency and foreclosure frameworks, and to ensure reliable and swift systems for the issuance of title deeds and the transfer of immovable property rights.

3. Accelerate the reduction of non-performing loans by setting related quantitative and time-bound targets for banks and ensuring accurate valuation of collateral for provisioning purposes. Create the conditions for a functional secondary market for non-performing loans. Integrate and strengthen the supervision of insurance companies and pension funds.

	There has been <u>some progress</u> on taking measures to ensure a decline in non-performing loans and accurate valuations of collateral for provisioning purposes. In particular, due to increased loan restructuring efforts incentivised by Government and Central Bank of Cyprus measures, the stock of NPLs has started to decline, but remains at a very high level. Some steps were also taken to create a secondary market for loans although no transaction has taken place.	
	There has been <u>some progress</u> in increasing the range of information available for creditors through the credit registry, which is currently operational for loan origination purposes.	
4. Remove impediments to investment, in particular by implementing the action plan for growth , pursuing the privatisation plan and strengthening the national regulatory authorities. Take measures to increase access to finance for small and medium-sized enterprises.	Cyprus has made some progress towards removing impediments to investment as it started implementing the action plan for growth and made some minor progress with regard to privatisation, while limited progress was achieved concerning the facilitation of SME's access to finance.	4. Accelerate the implementation of the action plan for growth, focusing in particular on fast-tracking strategic investments and improving access to finance and by end-2017, resume the implementation of the privatisation plan. Carry out the ownership unbundling of the Electricity Authority of Cyprus by the end of 2017.
	There has been <u>some progress</u> in implementing the action plan for growth. However, many workstreams have yet to enter their implementation phase. There has been <u>limited progress</u> in pursuing the privatisation plan. Draft bills aimed at launching the privatisation process of the Cyprus Telecommunications Authority (CyTA) were abandoned at the eve of the May 2016 general election, due to strong political opposition. Alternative proposals have not yet been formulated. Although minor privatisation projects still follow their course, budgetary funding for the privatisation unit has been cancelled.	
	There has been some progress in strengthening the national regulatory authorities, notably through the capacity increase of the energy regulator CERA. There has been limited progress in increasing access to finance for SMEs, as most new initiatives from the authorities remain at a preliminary stage.	

5. Enhance the capacity of the public employment services and their provision to the long-term unemployed; improve outreach to the non-registered unemployed. Adopt legislation for a hospital reform and advance with the planned implementation of universal health care coverage.

There has been **limited progress** overall in addressing CSR 5.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made concerning the enhancement of the capacity of the public employment services. This is because the recruitment of additional counsellors has been continuously delayed and the plans for improving the service remain vague. Some progress has been made to reach out to the non-registered unemployed, especially young people, but the outcome of these initiatives in terms of outcomes is not yet known.

There has been <u>limited progress</u> in adopting legislation for a hospital reform and advancing with the planned implementation of universal healthcare coverage. Two bills for the creation of the National Health System and the autonomy of public hospitals were submitted to the House of Representatives, and are currently under discussion.

5. Speed up reforms aimed at increasing the capacity of public employment services and improving the quality of active labour market policies delivery. Complete the reform of the education system to improve its labour market relevance and performance, including teachers' evaluation. By end-2017, adopt legislation for a hospital reform and universal health care coverage.

Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and 2017 is limited to the allowance linked to the systemic pension reform and the major structural reform in the healthcare sector. Reduce the tax wedge for low-income earners by exploiting a growth-friendly tax shift towards environmental and property taxes and improving tax compliance.	does not include an assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact): The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in spring when final data for 2016 will be available. Limited progress has been made in shifting the tax burden away from low-wage earners. Adopted measures have a limited effect. The tax wedge on low-wage earners remains high, while there is a scope to shift taxation to consumption, property and capital. Some progress has been made in improving tax compliance. A number of small measures have been introduced. The increased tax revenue relative to the tax base demonstrates a better collection.	1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to achieve its medium term budgetary objective in 2018, taking into account the allowances linked to the implementation of the systemic pension reform and of the structural reforms for which a temporary deviation is granted. Reduce taxation for low-income earners by shifting it to other sources that are less detrimental to growth and by improving tax compliance.
2. Improve the adequacy of social assistance benefits and step up measures supporting recipients in finding and retaining work, including through increased coverage of activation measures. Speed up the curricula reform in vocational education, establish — with the involvement of social partners — a regulatory framework for workbased learning and increase their offer. Improve the accessibility, quality and cost-effectiveness of the healthcare system.	Limited progress has been made in improving adequacy of social assistance benefits. The key reform of the minimum income level was not implemented as planned in 2017 and future plans are uncertain. The family state benefit has been excluded from the means test to qualify for social assistance with a limited improvement in benefit adequacy. Some progress has been made in supporting social assistance recipients in finding and retaining work. The EU financed programmes have picked up in 2016 after a dip in 2015. Measures for vulnerable groups are expanded, but regional mobility support is not fully	2. Improve the adequacy of the social safety net and up-skill the labour force by speeding up the curricula reform in vocational education. Increase cost-effectiveness and access to healthcare, including by reducing out of pocket payments and long waiting times.

the social assistance for three months from start of employment. Some progress has been made in improving vocational education. The regulatory framework for work-based learning and on development of VET programmes is established. Limited progress has been made on curricula reform in 2016, which is to be finalised in 2021. **Limited progress** has been made. The current structure of the system, with high out-of-pocket and informal payments, still leaves much of the population with unmet healthcare needs. There is some increase in public funding in 2017, but no medium-term financing plans have been adopted yet. The implementation of e-health services is delayed. 3. Pursue the consolidation of research institutions Some progress: 3. Increase efficiency and accountability in the public and provide incentives for private investment in **sector**, notably by simplifying administrative procedures **Some progress** has been made in the consolidation of **innovation.** Strengthen the conflict of interest prevention and strengthening the conflict of interest prevention research institutions and in private innovation incentives. regime and set up a common legal framework for all regime, including for insolvency administrators. The consolidation of research institutions is ongoing. **public employees**. Increase the accountability and public Business investment in R&D has slightly declined and oversight of insolvency administrators. remains low in international comparison. Limited progress has been made in strengthening the conflict of interest prevention regime. The legislative framework has been further developed by granting more independence of the director of the corruption prevention office and by an expert-based selection process of the director, but there is political reluctance to apply this framework. The draft Public Service Law has not progressed and will be reviewed in light of the upcoming public service reform. Some progress has been made in increasing the accountability and public oversight of insolvency administrators. Legal framework and tools for supervision of insolvency administrators have been put in place. The capacity of the state police is gradually increased for preventing criminal offences related to

insolvency.

LT	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
	1. Ensure that the deviation from the medium-term budgetary objective is limited to the allowance linked to the systemic pension reform in 2016 and in 2017. Reduce the tax burden on low-income earners by shifting the tax burden to other sources less detrimental to growth and improve tax compliance, in particular in the area of VAT.	Some progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact): Substantial progress has been made in reducing the tax burden on low-wage earners. Lithuania has substantially increased the non-taxable allowance for the low wage earners. Lithuania raised the non-taxable allowance and the allowance for dependent children substantially as from 2017. As a result, the tax wedge to low earners is lowered by up to 2.5 pp for households without children and by up to 3.5 pp to households with children. However, these tax measures fail to further lower the tax wedge to some of the most vulnerable households, e.g. single earners with two children or more. Some progress in shifting the tax burden to other sources. Measures to compensate for the revenue loss due to reduced tax burden on labour cover about a half of those losses. The diversity of new tax sources; however, is limited however as the vast majority of additional revenue comes from increase in excise taxes on cigarettes and alcohol. Some progress in improving tax compliance. Lithuania has adopted a number of measures that are expected to improve its analytical and tax collection ability substantially. The actual impact on tax collection of these efforts; however is yet to be seen. During 2016 Lithuania introduced an electronic invoicing system and an electronic waybill system.	1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to remain at its medium term budgetary objective in 2018, taking into account the allowances linked to the implementation of the systemic pension reform and of the structural reforms for which a temporary deviation is granted. Improve tax compliance and broaden the tax base to sources that are less detrimental to growth. Take steps to address the medium term fiscal sustainability challenge related to pensions.

2. Strengthen investment in human capital and address skills shortages, by improving the labour market relevance of education, raising the quality of teaching and adult learning. Reinforce the coverage and effectiveness of active labour market policies. Strengthen the role of social dialogue mechanisms. Improve the performance of the healthcare system by strengthening outpatient care, disease prevention and health promotion. Improve the coverage and adequacy of unemployment benefits and social assistance.

Some progress:

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in strengthening the investment in human capital. Overall, Lithuania has adopted some measures that partly address the CSR, but a fair amount of work is still needed to fully address the CSR.

Lithuania continues implementing measures to improve the attractiveness of vocational education and training, and has taken steps to expand availability of work-based learning.

However, there is limited progress on improving the quality of teaching, and especially the working conditions and professional development of teachers.

Also, there is a lack of improvement in the uptake of adult learning.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in reinforcing the coverage and effectiveness of active labour market policies. Overall, LT has adopted some measures that partly address the CSR, but a fair amount of work is still needed to fully address the CSR.

Lithuanian Public Employment Service implemented specific activation projects targeting the low-skilled, long-term unemployed, older and disabled persons.

Lithuania has adopted the new Law on Employment, which is planned to come into force in July 2017.

 $\underline{\underline{Some\ progress}}$ in strengthening the role of social dialogue mechanisms.

LT has adopted the legislative package on the "new social model", among them a new labour code. It includes new provisions for collective bargaining, industrial action, and the participation in the Tripartite Council, but the implementation is postponed to 1 July 2017.

The Ministry of Social Affairs and Labour has adopted the Action Plan for Strengthening of Social Dialogue in **2. Address skills shortages** through effective active labour market policy measures and adult learning and improve educational outcomes by rewarding quality in teaching and in higher education. **Improve the performance of the healthcare system** by strengthening outpatient care, disease prevention and affordability. **Improve the adequacy of the social safety net.**

Lithuania for 2016-2020. It will support the promotion of social dialogue between employers and employees' representatives (at national and local levels), and include other measures, including capacity building for the social partners, in order to foster the social dialogue. However, some social partners indicated that they were not fully involved in designing the Action Plan, which may not cover their real needs.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in improving the performance of healthcare system.

Lithuania has advanced on the fourth stage of the health system reform, particularly on shifting patients from inpatient to outpatient settings.

A State Health Promotion Fund was established in 2016 funded by resources from alcohol excise duties and some projects are being supported by the fund; other small projects are being implemented.

Other actions that could support the improvement of the performance of the health system, as the Action Plan for reducing health inequalities 2014-2023 are still to be effectively launched.

Regarding corruption on healthcare the authorities have concrete plans that seem to be adequate, but, as in all other areas, the success of implementation will be crucial.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made in improving the coverage and adequacy of unemployment benefits. There was no progress in the adequacy of social assistance but a slight one as regards coverage.

LT has adopted measures that address the CSR, but a fair amount of work is still needed to fully address the CSR as only a few of the adopted measures have been implemented, and their effect is not tangible yet.

LT has adopted the new labour code and the "social model", but the implementation is postponed to 1 July 2017. The initial analysis shows that while coverage of the unemployment insurance benefits may increase, the

increase in adequacy could be only marginal. The effect of the new legislation "on the ground" is not clear at the moment. Regarding the social benefits, the amendments indeed increase the coverage, and for some beneficiary groups, the adequacy might be slightly improved. However, overall the adequacy of the social benefits remains low, and no major changes have been implemented since 2008. 3. Take measures to strengthen productivity and **Limited progress:** 3. Take measures to strengthen productivity by improve the adoption and absorption of new improving the efficiency of public investment and technology across the economy. Improve the Limited progress has been made in strengthening the strengthening its linkage with the country's strategic coordination of innovation policies and encourage productivity. objectives. **private investment,** inter alia, by developing alternative Although, implementation of the European Structural means of financing. and Investment Funds and the Lithuanian Smart Specialisation Framework are expected to support this process in the coming years, no additional measures to address the challenge have been adopted. Limited progress has been made to improve coordination of innovation policies. President's Office called for reforms in the "Lithuanian Science and Innovation Policy Reform Guidelines", these were adopted by the Parliament and are expected to trigger the reform process in 2017. **Some progress** has been made in developing alternative means of financing. Lithuania has helped establish and fund a number of venture capital and seed capital funds. Also, the government has recently passed a law on crowd-

investing.

LU	

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: -MIP: -

1. Ensure the long-term sustainability of public pensions by increasing the effective retirement age, by limiting early retirement and increasing incentives to work longer, and by aligning the statutory retirement age to changes in life expectancy.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress: Progress has [been] limited for all subparts of the CSR and no progress has been made in relation to the recommendation to align the statutory retirement age to changes in life expectancy.

Limited progress in ensuring the sustainability of the public finances. A working group on pensions was set up in April 2016 with the task of carrying out a sustainability analysis of the pension system. In early December 2016 a report was published. It contains a detailed analysis of the situation of the national pension system. It shows inter alia that based on current scenario (the Ageing Working Group) revenues from contributions will remain higher than pension expenditure up to 2022 (the last year of the current contribution period). Simulations were also done with alternative scenarios. These simulations show that under less favourable economic and demographic assumptions, the size of the pension challenge could be larger than currently estimated.

<u>Limited progress</u> in increasing the effective retirement age. A law on reclassification of workers with working disabilities has been adopted in 2015 and is being implemented since the beginning of 2016. It aims to keep workers with disabilities in the labour market. It is too early to assess its impact however.

<u>Limited progress</u> on reforms regarding early retirement. A draft law to modify existing legislation on early retirement is still to be discussed in the Parliament.

<u>Limited progress</u> on increasing incentives to work longer. A legislative initiative, referred to as 'Age Pact', which includes a whole package of measures to keep workers longer in employment, is tabled in the Parliament, but it has not been adopted yet.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: -MIP: -

2. Ensure the long-term sustainability of the pension system, limit early retirement and increase the employment rate of older people.

	No progress in aligning the statutory retirement age to	
	changes in life expectancy. There are no measures to link	
	the effective retirement age to changes in life expectancy.	
2. Remove barriers to investment and innovation that	Limited progress: Progress has been limited in	1. Strengthen the diversification of the economy,
limit economic development in the business services	removing barriers to investment, while some progress has	including by removing barriers to investment and
sector. Address bottlenecks that hamper housing	been made in addressing bottlenecks to housing	innovation. Remove regulatory restrictions in the
investment.	investment.	business services sector.
	<u>Limited progress</u> in removing barriers to investment and	
	innovation that limit economic development in the	
	business services sector. By decision of the 'Conseil de	
	Gouvernement' of 2 September 2016, the fixed tariffs in	
	public contracts for the services provided by architects	
	and engineers have been abolished.	
	Some progress in addressing bottlenecks that hamper	
	housing investment. Numerous measures have been	
	adopted or are planned. The measures are: i) a reform of	
	local government financing has been adopted in	
	December 2016. It links, at least partially, the financing	
	of the municipalities to initiatives favouring housing	
	investment; ii) a draft 'Omnibus' law (n. 6704) has been	
	approved at beginning of 2017. Among others, it aims at	
	streamlining the building permits procedure; iii) the tax	
	reform includes measures intended to provide incentives	
	to increase the supply of houses and construction land	
	(temporary tax exemption for 50 % of the capital gain	
	realised on the sale of constructible land); and iv) an	
	initiative to produce a new sectoral housing plan.	
	Nevertheless, the challenge ahead for the Luxembourg	
	authorities remains sizeable.	

Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -

- 1. In view of the high risk of a significant deviation, achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,3 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and of 0,6 % of GDP in 2017, unless the medium-term budgetary objective is respected with a lower effort, by taking the necessary structural measures.
- The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in Spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the

sustainability of Hungary's public finances.

2. Further reduce sector-specific taxes and reduce the tax wedge for low-income earners. Strengthen transparency and competition in public procurement through e-procurement, increased publication of tenders and further improvement of the anti-corruption framework. Improve the regulatory environment in the services sector and in the retail sector by addressing restrictive regulations and ensuring predictability.

Limited progress:

Hungary has made <u>limited progress</u> in addressing the first subpart of CSR 2 as regards the further reduction of sectorial taxes. By means of measures adopted (published) on 15.6.2016 and implemented with effect from 1.1.2017, the bank levy on the taxable base in excess of HUF 50 billion is reduced from 0.24% to 0.21% of the balance sheet total. This reflects a downward trend as the bank levy was first reduced as of 1.1.2016 from 0.53% to 0.24%. At the same time, some distortive sectorial taxes remain, in particular in the telecommunications sector (utilities tax, telecommunications tax,) and the energy sector (Robin Hood tax, utilities tax).

Hungary has made **some progress** in addressing the second subpart of CSR 2 as regards the reduction of the tax wedge for low-income earners. By means of measures announced in November 2016 and implemented with effect from 1.1.2017, the employers' social security contributions are cut from 27% to 22% and are set to be further reduced to 20% from 2018. This general measure reduces the tax wedge for all employees. Personal income tax allowance for families with two children is further increased. The tax wedge of low-income earners however remains higher than the EU average and in regional peers.

As regards anti-corruption, Hungary has made <u>limited</u> <u>progress</u>. New measures taken streamline the internal

2. Complete the reduction of the tax wedge for low-income earners and simplify the tax structure, notably by reducing the most distortive sector-specific taxes. Strengthen transparency and competition in public procurement, by implementing a comprehensive and efficient e-procurement system, and strengthen the anticorruption framework. Strengthen regulatory predictability, transparency and competition in particular in the services sector, notably in retail.

control and the integrity management functions. The real impact of the national anti-corruption programme's approach on preventing and curbing down corruption has not been evaluated yet. No legal measures have been taken to improve the protection of whistle-blowers or to reduce favouritism among government officials. Prosecution of high-level corruption remains limited and affects deterrence. Limited progress can be seen as regards public procurement. Revised versions of the eprocurement strategy were sent in the second half of 2016. Although the document is a solid basis for future developments. Hungary also committed to develop an eprocurement system, and test it through a pilot project. So far, no pilot project has been launched, nor did Hungary draw up a concrete concept of what it intends to do in this regard.

Regarding service sector in the field of energy, the concentration of household gas customers into one gas supplier and regulated end-user prices eliminates retail competition and does not contribute to attract investments in the energy utility sector. **No progress** has been made on improving the regulatory environment in the services sector and in the retail sector.

3. Facilitate the transition from the public works scheme to the primary labour market and reinforce other active labour market policies. Improve the adequacy and coverage of social assistance and unemployment benefits. Take measures to improve educational outcomes and to increase the participation of disadvantaged groups, in particular Roma, in inclusive mainstream education.

Limited progress:

Hungary has made **some progress** in reinforcing active labour market policies other than the public work scheme. Following legislative changes PWS participants are now entitled to a placement benefit if they find employment in the primary labour market. The training component of the PWS has been enhanced. As of January 2017 further activation measures were introduced. From 2016, the ESF co-financed "Training of Low-skilled and Public Workers" programme supports training for among others public workers. PWS participants also receive training supported by funds from the Ministry of Interior. During the first ten months of 2016 almost 20 thousand public workers were involved in trainings. ESF (and YEI) supported ALMP programmes started to roll out in 2015 and 2016. The two major programmes are the

3. Better target the public works scheme to those furthest away from the labour market and provide effective support to jobseekers in order to facilitate transitions to the labour market, including by reinforcing active labour market policies. Take measures to improve education outcomes and to increase the participation of disadvantaged groups, in particular Roma, in inclusive mainstream education. Improve the adequacy and coverage of social assistance and the duration of unemployment benefits.

"Path to the labour market" and the Youth Guarantee. Until the end of October 2016, more than 39,000 people have been involved in the first programme, and more than 41,000 young people in the YG. The national expenditure for active labour market policies is planned to be gradually increased, whereas expenditures of the public work schemes will be decreased in the upcoming years. In 2017 the budgetary allocation for public works is set to stabilize while spending on other ALMPs is set to increase.

<u>Limited progress</u> was observed with regards to the improving the adequacy and coverage of social assistance and unemployment benefits. The duration of unemployment benefits is still the lowest in the EU at 3 months. The budget for 2017 foresees an increase (by about 5%) of the nominal value of some benefits: elderly support, care assistance, child support benefit. There has been a 12% increase regarding the so called "homeacquisition" support provided for those young people who leave institutional care. The level of the other entitlements is not planned to change in 2017.

Hungary made <u>limited progress</u> in improving educational outcomes and increasing participation of disadvantaged groups in inclusive mainstream education. Recent PISA results show a deterioration of educational outcomes. The distribution of disadvantaged pupils between schools is uneven and the corresponding corrective mechanisms are insufficient. National and European surveys indicate that increasing shares of Roma children attend Roma-majority schools and classes. Legislative changes aiming at addressing this have been tabled, but remain to be adopted and implemented.

MT	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
	1. In view of the high risk of a significant deviation, achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,6 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017, by taking the necessary structural measures. Step up measures to ensure the long-term sustainability of public finances.	Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact). Malta has made limited progress in improving the sustainability of public finances. The Draft Budgetary Plan reports on the initiatives to address the fiscal structural country specific recommendations, although no new elements are reported compared to the situation in spring. In particular, in the area of pension reform, some measures were introduced already with the 2016 budget, targeted at addressing sustainability and adequacy. A full assessment of the budgetary impact is still missing, but initial assessments show that measures to achieve sustainability are not yet as ambitious as to respond to the long term challenges. In addition, the 2017 budget introduced a number of new measures targeted at increasing pension income. Policy action to improve the sustainability of the healthcare system is ongoing. However, it is uncertain whether these measures are sufficient to cope with the challenge of long-term sustainability. An estimate of their potential impact to be	1. Expand the scope of the ongoing spending reviews to the broader public sector and introduce performance-based public spending.
	2. Take measures to strengthen labour supply, in particular through increased participation of low-skilled persons in lifelong learning.	incorporated into the long-term budgetary projections is still missing. Some progress: Malta has made some progress in strengthening labour supply by improving access and participation in lifelong learning, with a focus on the low-skilled. The National Lifelong Learning Strategy is under implementation, with relevant upskilling and reskilling initiatives. Literacy, numeracy and IT courses are offered in the community, including through cooperation with Local Councils and LEAP centres. () Free of charge revision classes are provided to those who failed or were absent for their examination. Besides the Alternative Learning	

	Ducamama two other programmes are offered to	
	Programme, two other programmes are offered to	
	students who at the end of compulsory education acquire	
	no or minimum qualifications: 'Youth Inc.' and	
	'GEM16+'. Malta is working to increase access to second	
	chance education for those with no formal secondary	
	education certificate, through the Malta College of Arts,	
	Science and Technology (MCAST). In 2016 a	
	programme called Skills Kits which offers more flexible	
	and customised pathways was launched. Counselling and	
	orientation is provided for students in education through	
	VET and higher education. In addition services are	
	available to unemployed within Public Employment	
	Services. However, less attention is given to those	
	already in employment.	
		2. Ensure the effective supervision of internationally
		oriented business by financial institutions, licensed in
		Malta in cooperation with the host supervisors in the
		countries where they operate.

NL Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 3	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: - MIP: CSR 1, 2
1. Limit the deviation from the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,6 % of GDP in 2017. Prioritise public expenditure towards supporting more investment in research and development.	No progress in addressing the fiscal-structural part of CSR 1 (This overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact) No progress has been made in prioritising public expenditure towards supporting more investment in research and development.	1. Use fiscal policy to support domestic demand, including investment in research and development. Take measures to reduce the remaining distortions in the housing market and the debt bias for households, in particular by decreasing mortgage interest tax deductibility.
2. Tackle remaining barriers to hiring staff on permanent contracts and facilitate the transition from temporary to permanent contracts. Address the high increase in self-employed without employees, including by reducing tax distortions favouring self-employment, without compromising entrepreneurship, and by promoting access of the self- employed to affordable social protection.	No (further) progress has been made in tackling remaining barriers to hiring staff or in facilitating transition from temporary to permanent contracts. No progress has been made in reducing tax distortions favouring self-employment or increasing the social protection coverage of self-employed. Limited progress has been made in addressing the increase in using self-employed without employees. With the Employment Relationships Deregulation Act (Wet DBA) the Netherlands have implemented a mechanism that reduces the incentives for employers to replace employees by bogus self-employed. But the enforcement of this law has recently been postponed until at least the beginning of 2018. In the Perspectives Memorandum the government developed a vision for a possible reform of the pension system that may also include the coverage of self-employed under the second pillar of the pension system on a voluntary basis.	2. Tackle remaining barriers to hiring staff on permanent contracts. Address the high increase in the self-employed without employees, including by reducing tax distortions favouring self-employment, without compromising entrepreneurship, and by promoting access of the self-employed to affordable social protection. Based on the broad preparatory process already launched, make the second pillar of the pension system more transparent, inter-generationally fairer and more resilient to shocks. Create conditions to promote higher real wage growth, respecting the role of the social partners.
3. Take measures to make the second pillar of the pension system more transparent, intergenerationally fairer and more resilient to shocks. Take measures to reduce the remaining distortions in the housing market and the debt bias for households, in	Limited progress: Limited progress: With the Perspectives Memorandum, the government announced its ambition to reform the second pillar of the pensions system, but the development	See CSR 1 (distortions in the housing market, decreasing mortgage interest tax deductibility) See CSR 2 (the second pillar of the pension system)

	particular by deductibility.	decreasing	mortgage	interest	tax	and the implementation of a reform is left to the next government. This points to limited progress.	
						No progress has been made regarding the distortions in the housing market, since no additional reforms have been implemented and the mortgage interest tax deductibility has not been reduced further.	

AT	

Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1

MIP: -

1. Ensure that the deviation from the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017 is limited to the allowance linked to the budgetary impact of the exceptional inflow of refugees in 2015, and to that effect achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,3 % of GDP in 2017 unless the medium-term budgetary objective is respected with a lower effort. Ensure the sustainability of the healthcare system, and of the **pension system** by linking the statutory pension age to life expectancy. Simplify, rationalise and streamline fiscal relations and responsibilities across the various lavers of government.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Some progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact):

The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in Spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

Some progress can be reported in ensuring the sustainability of the healthcare system. The 2017 financial equalisation law has set more stringent expenditure targets. The provision of outpatient care has been strengthened by the creation of a new legal framework for multi-disciplinary primary care centres with an earmarked budget. Incentives for hospitals to treat outpatient cases as inpatient cases have been reduced.

Limited progress in ensuring the long-term sustainability of the pension system, as financial incentives for working beyond the statutory retirement age are likely to marginally increase the effective retirement age.

No progress has been made in addressing CSR 1 on increasing the sustainability of the pension system by linking the statutory retirement age to life expectancy. The Austrian government has no intention to take measures establishing a link between the statutory retirement age and life expectancy.

Some progress in simplifying, rationalising and streamlining fiscal relations and responsibilities across the various layers of government. The 2017 financial equalisation law implemented a few steps to increase the tax autonomy of sub-national governments, even if the misalignment between revenue-raising powers and spending responsibilities remains high. The system of

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to achieve its medium term budgetary objective in 2018, taking into account the allowance linked to unusual events. Ensure the sustainability of the healthcare system and of the pension system. Rationalise and streamline competencies across the various layers of government and align their financing and spending responsibilities.

	inter-government transfers has been slightly simplified, while the revenue-sharing system has been made more task-orientation. The efficiency and adaptability of the fiscal framework has been improved with the introduction of the legal basis for regular spending reviews and a system of benchmarks. The different government subsectors have committed to a reform of their respective competencies.	
2. Improve the labour market participation of women. Take steps to improve the educational achievements of disadvantaged young people, in particular those from a migrant background.	Some progress: Some progress can be reported regarding increasing childcare infrastructure and services. The right for part-time workers of a business to receive information about full-time job offers has been implemented. Awareness-raising of the advantages and disadvantages of full-time and part-time employment has been enforced. Overall the increasing labour market participation of women is mainly based on part-time employment. No new measures have been taken to substantially increase full-time employment of women.	2. Improve labour market outcomes of women, also through the provision of full-time care services. Improve the educational achievements of disadvantaged young people, in particular those from a migrant background. Foster investment in the services sector by reducing administrative and regulatory barriers, easing market entry and facilitating company growth.
	Some progress in addressing the need to improve the educational achievements of disadvantaged young people, in particular those from a migrant background. This progress takes the form of the step-by-step implementation of the education reform agreed in September 2015 which allocates EUR 750 million for expanding the number of all-day schools over the next 6 years. Reform measures in early childhood education and care and primary schools have already been implemented. Measures to increase schools' autonomy and improve task distribution between the federal level and the regions are planned for adoption before April 2017. However, these measures have not yet had an impact on education outcomes.	
3. Reduce, in the area of services, administrative and regulatory barriers for investments, such as restrictive authorisation requirements and restrictions on legal form and shareholding, and impediments to setting up interdisciplinary companies.	Limited progress: Limited progress: Austria presented a draft revision of the trade licence act (Gewerbeordnung) in November 2016. This revision removes access barriers for 19 trades (Teilgewerbe), abolishes the initial registration fee and increases the scope for performing side activities without	See CSR 2 (reduction of administrative and regulatory barriers for investment in the services sector)

an additional licence (15-30 % instead of currently around 10 %). The high number of regulated trades (reglementierte Gewerbe) remains unchanged, however, and the law still requires separate licences for each of the 459 free trades (freie Gewerbe). Austria is also simplifying the procedure for authorising installations on business premises (Betriebsanlagen). Low-risk installations will benefit from a simplified procedure, deadlines for granting authorisations will be shortened, a one-stop shop for different types of permits will be created and publication requirements will be reduced. As regards other restrictions on access to and exercise of the regulated professions, only relatively minor changes have been implemented.

No progress: Efforts which were started in November 2015 to remove restrictions on interdisciplinary companies have subsequently been discontinued.

PL	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
	1. Achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,5 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017. Strengthen the fiscal framework, including by establishing an independent fiscal council. Improve tax collection by ensuring better VAT compliance, and limit the extensive use of reduced VAT rates.	Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact): The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in spring when final data for 2016 will be available. No progress has been made on establishing a fiscal council. The authorities do not envisage implementing one. Some progress was made in improving tax collection. Several measures aimed at fighting tax fraud in the fuel sector entered into force in 2016. They are followed by a large amendment of the VAT law that entered into force in 2017. A new National Revenue Administration will become operational in March 2017. In contrast, no progress was made on limiting the extensive use of reduced VAT rates.	1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of Poland's public finances. Take steps to improve the efficiency of public spending and limit the use of reduced VAT rates.
	2. Ensure the sustainability and adequacy of the pension system and increase participation in the labour market, by starting to reform the preferential pension arrangements, removing obstacles to more permanent types of employment and improving the labour market-relevance of education and training.	No progress: No progress in ensuring the sustainability and adequacy of the pension system. Contrary to the CSR, a lowering of the statutory retirement age has been voted in and will enter into force as of October 2017. In the longer term, it will worsen sustainability and adequacy of the pension system. No progress in reforming the preferential pension arrangements, although there are plans to review them with a view to reform them (including those for farmers and miners). No progress in increased participation in the labour market. Some measures undertaken so far seem to go in the opposite direction. In particular, lowering the statutory retirement age and the new child benefit could have adverse effects on the labour market participation. Limited progress in removing obstacles to more	2. Take steps to increase labour market participation, in particular for women, low-qualified and older people, including by fostering adequate skills and removing obstacles to more permanent types of employment. Ensure the sustainability and adequacy of the pension system by taking measures to increase the effective retirement age and by starting to reform the preferential pension arrangements.

3. Take measures to remove obstacles to investment in transport, construction and energy infrastructure, and increase the coverage of spatial planning at local level.		3. Take measures to remove barriers to investment, particularly in the transport sector.
	Limited progress in simplifying construction permitting and rationalising spatial planning at the local level. Construction permits were practically abolished for constructing private houses and other smaller structures, though they are still required for other construction projects. The newly drafted Construction Code contains elements related to spatial planning and aimed at improving the current system, like: consolidating old legislation on spatial planning and construction permitting, streamlining procedures into a single investment decision, reinforcing the role of municipal studies on territorial development and making more stringent the conditions, under which new developments could take place in the absence of the spatial development plan.	



Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4, 5

1. Ensure a durable correction of the excessive deficit, in accordance with the relevant decisions or recommendations under the excessive deficit procedure, by taking the necessary structural measures and by using all windfall gains for deficit and debt reduction. Thereafter, achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of at least 0,6 % of GDP. Conduct, by February 2017, a comprehensive expenditure review and strengthen expenditure control, cost effectiveness and adequate budgeting at all levels of public administration. Ensure the long-term sustainability of the health sector, without compromising access to primary healthcare. Reduce the reliance of the pension system on budgetary transfers. By the end of 2016, refocus ongoing restructuring plans of state-owned enterprises.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress (this excludes an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact).

The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in Spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

<u>Some progress</u> in conducting a comprehensive expenditure review. The authorities have started a spending review exercise, mainly based on efficiency measures that involve the health and education ministries; state-owned enterprises and (centralised) public procurement and real estate management). This spending review still falls short of a comprehensive approach since its scope only covers the central government and focused on efficiency savings stemming from streamlining services.

Some progress in ensuring the long-term sustainability of the healthcare sector. As Portugal is expected to have the highest increase in healthcare costs in the EU by 2060, more efforts for cost compression should be pursued including by integrating primary care, hospital services and continuous care. However, health care prevention and access to primary health care have been improved which will definitely help Portugal meet the long term challenges facing its health care sector, Nonetheless, the increase stock of arrears adds strain to the system's fiscal sustainability in the short-term.

<u>Limited progress</u> in reducing the reliance of pension system on budgetary transfers. The draft budget for 2017 includes the earmarking of a new progressive tax on real estate portfolios (on top of the IMI) to the social security's Financial Stabilization Fund (worth EUR 160 million in 2017 according to the 2017 draft budgetary plan 2017). Although this earmarking is being presented by the government as an alternative to the excessive reliance on

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 2, 3, 4

1. Ensure the durability of the correction of the excessive deficit. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of Portugal's public finances. Step up efforts to finalise a comprehensive expenditure review at all levels of public administration. Strengthen expenditure control, cost effectiveness and adequate budgeting, in particular in the health sector with a focus on the reduction of arrears in hospitals and ensure the sustainability of the pension system. To increase the financial sustainability of state-owned enterprises set sector-specific efficiency targets in time for the 2018 budget, improving state-owned enterprises' overall net income and decreasing the burden on the State budget.

		classical budgetary transfers, this does not address the	
		expenditure side of the pension system sustainability.	
		No progress in refocusing restructuring plans of state-	
		owned enterprises. In terms of their operational	
		performance state-owned enterprises fared well in 2016,	
		as shown by their positive EBIDTA (earnings before	
		interest, tax, depreciation and amortization). However,	
		indebtedness remains very high resulting in persistent	
		negative net income. The government so far has not	
		presented any concrete measures to significantly	
		restructure state-owned enterprises.	
2. In consultation with social		Limited progress:	See CSR 2 (consistency between minimum wage
minimum wage is consister		Timitad management in an arrival at the minimum and it	developments and employment)
promoting employment and	d competitiveness across	<u>Limited progress</u> in ensuring that the minimum wage is consistent with promotion of employment and	
sectors.		competitiveness. The minimum wage was raised most	
		recently in January 2017, from EUR 530 to EUR 557	
		i.e. above expected inflation and average productivity	
		increases. While increasing aggregate demand and	
		reducing in-work poverty, in a context of low inflation	
		and high unemployment, continued increases in the	
		minimum wage above productivity might put upward	
		pressures on the overall wage structure, with the risk of	
		affecting employment and competitiveness perspectives.	
		The government established a structure to monitor the	
		impact of minimum wage developments, through	
		quarterly reports which are published and discussed with	
		social partners.	
3. Ensure the effective act		Some progress:	2. Promote hiring on open-ended contracts, including
unemployed and improve t			by reviewing the legal framework. Ensure the effective
employment and social serv	ices. Strengthen incentives	<u>Limited progress</u> in ensuring effective activation of	activation of the long-term unemployed. Together with
for firms to hire through perm	nanent contracts.	long-term unemployed and in improving coordination	social partners, ensure that minimum wage
		between employment and social services. The rate of long-term unemployment remains one of the highest in	developments do not harm employment of the low- skilled.
		the EU, despite active labour market measures targeted at	skineu.
		long-term unemployed which have been developed in	
		recent years. To address this, the government produced	
		an assessment of active labour market policies. However,	
		no specific measures targeted at integrating the long-term	
		unemployed into the labour market have been adopted	
		since then. The public employment service's planned	
		increased use of online platforms instead of face-to-face-	

4. Take measures, by October 2016, to facilitate the cleaning up of the balance sheets of credit institutions and address the high level of non-performing loans. Reduce the debt bias in corporate taxation and improve

the access to finance for start-ups and small and

medium-sized enterprises via the capital market.

services should enable staff to focus on more personalised services for the long-term unemployed. As part of the ongoing administrative simplification process, one-stop shops for the long-term unemployed are being developed, although this initiative has not yet reached the implementation phase.

<u>Some progress</u> in strengthening incentives for firms to hire through permanent contracts. The Government redesigned its employment support programme to promote hiring on open-ended contracts while restricting the financial support for temporary contracts to specific cases such as the very long-term unemployed. However, the expected impact of the new measure in reducing segmentation is limited in view of the low number of people to be covered.

Limited progress:

<u>Limited progress</u> in facilitating the clean-up of credit institutions' balance sheets and addressing the high level of non-performing loans.

By Resolution of the Council of Ministers N. 42/2016 of 18 August 2016, the government approved the Capitalizar Programme. Under the programmes's "corporate restructuring" strand, the government intends to improve existing mechanisms for restructuring the balance of viable economic enterprises and the recovery of credits. The government is also taking action to revise its insolvency regime through the following: mechanisms to control the access to the PER (implementation period: first quarter of 2017); access of judicial administrators to the Citius dataset, the IT system to support the activities of the courts) (fully implemented); the right of judicial administrators to directly access the various databases (implementation planned for the first quarter of 2017); creation of electronic certificates (expected to be implemented in the first quarter of 2017); possibility of exemption from holding a meeting of creditors; changes to the legal framework to the new registration rules on cross-border insolvencies and interconnection of registries.

3. Step up efforts to **clean up the balance sheets of credit institutions** by implementing a comprehensive strategy addressing non-performing loans, including by enhancing the secondary market for bad assets. **Improve the access to capital**, in particular for start-ups and small and medium sized enterprises.

The tax law has been changed to remove disincentives to write-off. The central bank is conducting additional supervisory work, including by assessing banks' capability to manage non-performing loans, The central bank is also providing guidance to banks on how to screen different types of non-performing loans, and how to manage them. They are also considering an external servicing of loans, although the details have not been provided as to whether this would entail the creation of a market of distressed assets. Overall, a comprehensive strategy appears to be lacking.

Some progress in reducing the debt bias in corporate taxation. The 2017 draft budgetary plan includes broadening the scope of the allowance for corporate equity (ACE) regime. The regime now applies to all companies (previously it applied only to small and medium-sized enterprises) and shareholders (not only individuals and venture capital investors). In addition, the allowance has been increased from 5 % during 4 years to 7 % during 6 years.

Limited progress in improving the access to finance for start-ups and small and medium-sized enterprises via the capital market. Under the Capitalizar Programme, the government has put forward measures to ease businesses' financing needs. A new credit line with a mutual guarantee has been made available and will allow financing to companies of more than EUR 1 billion in financing for companies. In parallel, the government has put in place another programme (Programa Semente) to finance for start ups and small enterprises in their early stages (seed capital), helping them to raise equity finance by offering tax reliefs, for at least two years, to individual investors who purchase new shares in such companies, These programmes are expected to improve the financing of companies in Portugal, provided that they are swiftly and fully implemented.

5. Increase transparency and efficiency in public procurement as regards public-private partnerships and concessions. By the end of 2016, **improve and accelerate administrative and licensing procedures, accelerate tax litigations and reduce regulatory**

Some progress:

<u>Some progress</u> in increasing transparency in public procurement. Transparency and reliability of public procurement data is improving. The institute for Monitoring Public Procurement (IMPIC) is moving from

4. Implement a roadmap to further reduce the administrative burden and tackle regulatory barriers in construction and business services by end 2017. Increase the efficiency of insolvency and tax proceedings.

barriers, especially in business services. Incentivise cooperation between universities and the business sector.

a case by case approach on correcting data in BASE to a more systematic and automated system. Access to procurement data by control and prosecution authorities is not automatic, because of the legal framework on data protection, which hampers efficient checks and investigations. By Decree N. 18/2016, the government has established quarterly monitoring and reporting procedures related for local and regional public private partnerships and concessions. The use of direct awards remains high and there are weaknesses in the tender procedures due to: (i) insufficient justification underpinning the recourse to direct awards; (ii) splitting of contracts; (iii) lack of capacity and professionalization an (iv) limited checks.

<u>Limited progress</u> in improving and accelerating licensing procedures by the end of 2016. The SIMPLEX + initiative includes some cross cutting simplification measures, yet to be implemented, but progress in enhancing the business environment has largely stalled in relation to sector specific regulation.

<u>Some progress</u> in accelerating tax litigations by the end of 2016. The Tax Administration has drawn up a multiannual plan to combat fraud, improve tax collection and simplify tax procedures. The 2017 draft budgetary plan introduced provisions for the tax authorities to: reduce response time for issuing binding rulings (Autoridade Tributária) to a maximum of 75 days in all urgent requests, significantly reduce the deadline for urgent requests; also, assess the possibility of reducing the costs of urgent binding ruling. Despite these efforts, the tax courts' clearance rate remains low.

<u>Limited progress</u> in reducing regulatory barriers especially in business services by the end of 2016. Previous reform efforts targeting the most restrictive business services, including regulated professions, were halted and, in some cases, reversed. Restrictions on corporate groups for professional firms and restrictive regulation of legal professions (legal form, shareholding, management, multidisciplinary, advertising restrictions) set to remain in place.

Some progress in incentivising cooperation between universities and the business sector. New initiatives announced include the creation of collaborative laboratories, technological centres for engineering activities and new business innovation contracts. The government is currently preparing a revision of the Higher Education system. The new programme to modernise and revamp polytechnic institutes focuses on matching both R&D activities and dual VET programmes (CTeSPs) with regional needs. The Innovation Agency (ANI) is working to increase knowledge and collaborative innovation and has identified further potential players to bring into the innovation eco-system (including businesses and research organizations). It is also pushing for more collaboration as a priority for further action. However, there is no overall comprehensive strategy to foster cooperation between universities and the business sector: cooperation still relies mostly on isolated initiatives from specific universities or businesses.



Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -

1. Limit the deviation from the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,5 % of GDP in 2017 unless the medium-term budgetary objective is respected with a lower effort. Ensure the application of the fiscal framework and strengthen further tax compliance and collection. Ensure that legislative initiatives do not undermine legal certainty and do not put at risk financial stability. If necessary, adopt measures that mitigate such risks.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact).

CSRs related to compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact will be assessed in spring once the final data are available.

There was **no progress** on ensuring the application of the fiscal framework. The 2016 budget does not comply with the deficit rule, which contains the obligation to comply with the MTO; as in previous years, the authorities did not send an update of the fiscal strategy to Parliament by the statutory deadline of 15 August.

Limited progress. There are slight improvements with regard to the compliance ratios for tax declarations and payments for both natural persons and companies compared to the previous year. The tax administration (ANAF) and Labour inspection maintained their efforts in terms of inspections and audits, yet the results are not better compared to last year. ANAF introduced also an audience with the applicant as an additional step before issuing the final decision with regard to the VAT registration. The legislation for the registration and deregistration for VAT purposes has been modified and clarified again and the procedures for VAT reimbursement were adapted, respectively, in the course of 2016. The mandatory but progressive introduction of electronic cash-register connected to the National Agency for Fiscal Administration (ANAF) IT system is pursued, but further delays to the official deadlines were introduced. To tackle sectorial tax evasion, a special annual income tax will replace corporate income tax in specific business areas, such as accommodation services and bars/restaurants, from 2017. Irrespective of the sales or the net profits of the business, the tax to be paid will be computed based on coefficients, such as the surface of

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1

GP: CSR MIP: -

1. In 2017, ensure compliance with the Council recommendation of [XX] with a view to correcting the significant deviation from the adjustment path toward the medium-term budgetary objective. In 2018, pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. Ensure the full application of the fiscal framework. Strengthen tax compliance and collection. Fight undeclared work, including by ensuring the systematic use of integrated controls.

premises, the seasonality or the location of the business. Moreover, as of 2017, self-employed and family businesses will be limited to the number of business activities they can perform and in the number of persons they can employ.

<u>Some progress</u> was made on safeguarding financial stability. The law on debt discharge ("datio in solutum") was promulgated with retroactive application, but a recent decision of the Constitutional Court has mitigated some of the potential risks on financial stability. The CHF-denominated loan conversion law adopted by Parliament may put strain on several banks. However, before its enactment, the law was sent to the Constitutional Court for a constitutional heck.

2. Strengthen the National Employment Agency's services to employers and jobseekers, in particular by tailoring services to jobseeker profiles, better linking them with social assistance, including social services, and reaching out to unregistered young people. Establish, in consultation with social partners, objective criteria for setting the minimum wage. Take action to prevent early school leaving and increase the provision of quality education, in particular among Roma. Adopt the equalisation of the pension age for men and women.

Some progress:

Substantial progress was made in strengthening the National Employment Agency's (NEA) services. The NEA is undergoing a major change process reflected in a strategy and including 1) establishing for the first time an initial profiling and segmentation process, which became a working procedure and legislation in October 2016 (most of the people in NEA database have already been profiled); 2) Adoption of a catalogue of services, for the first time bringing together the service offer of the organisation towards jobseekers and towards employers; 3) Reinforcement of case management capacity - pilot project developed in October/November; to be up-scaled through the ESF; 4) Setting up an integrated approach to NEETs outreach, including a substantial increase in agency staff for the delivery of the Youth Guarantee- to be rolled out. The Youth Guarantee has so far only partially reached young NEETs. The NEA also plans to reinforce its capacity to strengthen its services for employers. The active labour market policies have been revised to provide more incentives for take up and several disadvantaged groups benefit for the first time from some ALMPs. A national mobility plan aims to improve the internal mobility. As regards linking employment with social services, a pilot project, finance d with EU funds, will be rolled out. This would target 100 deprived communities and would set up integrated teams that 2. Strengthen targeted activation policies and integrated public services, focusing on those furthest away from the labour market. Adopt legislation equalising the pension age for men and women. Establish a transparent mechanism for minimum wage-setting, in consultation with social partners. Improve access to quality mainstream education, in particular for Roma and children in rural areas. In healthcare, shift to outpatient care, and curb informal payments.

include social assistants, community health assistants/mediators and education counsellors/mediators. In the long run, these integrated teams are supposed to be scaled up at national level, in over 500 deprived communities. A common order of the ministers for Labour, Education and Health establishes the working methods of integrated teams. Special advisers dealing with disadvantaged groups are proposed to be hired in the Public employment service and would make the link with social services and integrated teams. The minimum inclusion income law increases the coverage and adequacy of social benefits and strengthens the provision of active labour market policies for Guaranteed Minimum Income beneficiaries. These reforms have the potential of tangible and lasting effects, but only if implemented and sustained over the longer term.

Limited progress was made on minimum wage setting. In January 2016, the government set up a tripartite working group with the task of establishing an indexation mechanism that would make future minimum wage adjustments automatic. This group has commissioned a study to analyse all the economic and social aspects of the minimum wage in Romania. As a follow up to this and based on the results of the study, clear guidelines and criteria, endorsed by social partners are supposed to be established in the first quarter of 2017. However, the new government announced the increase of the minimum wage from 1 February 2017 and subsequent increases until 2020, despite tripartite ongoing work on a minimum wage setting mechanism.

Some progress was made to tackle early school leaving and increase the provision of quality education. The situation for Roma inclusion in schools remains challenging. As a step on the implementation of the Early school Leaving Strategy, authorities have launched two national calls for proposals supported by the European Social Fund (approximately EUR 200 million) to tackle drop-out ('School for all') and improve the provision of quality education in disadvantaged schools ('Motivated teachers in disadvantaged schools'). These projects aim

to address two of the main drivers of early school leaving, namely insufficient prevention measures and insufficient provision of quality education. 'School for All' seeks to finance a wide range of activities, including integrated interventions for students and their parents, after-school programmes, and scholarships. The second call specifically aims to increase teaching quality in disadvantaged schools, in particular for Roma and schools in rural areas. The projects are now in the evaluation phase, with implementation expected to start the latest in September 2017. Therefore, the impact on reducing drop-outs or increasing teaching quality in disadvantaged school is yet to be seen. Other recent measures to tackle early school leaving include a warm meal pilot programme running in 50 schools, and full reimbursement of commuting costs for students from rural areas. The methodology for teachers' allowances was changed to include criteria on working with children at risk of drop-out (ministerial order from 22 December).

To support the participation of poor children in preschool education (empirically shown to prevent early school leaving) authorities are implementing the programme 'Every child in kindergarten' providing social vouchers on condition of attendance. To improve takeup, the application procedures were simplified. Although the number of beneficiary children who had not gone to kindergarten before is increasing, it remains relatively low (2 700 out of 67 000). Modernisation of the curricula for pre-school education is underway.

To increase quality in education, authorities have also approved the curricular frameworks for lower secondary education (grades 5-8). The new curriculum is expected to enter into force in September for 5th graders. However, plans to reform the curricula high school education have been delayed.

To increase managerial capacities in schools, a competition for school principals was organized, albeit allowing for some exceptions.

	Anti-segregation legislation was improved by expanding the criteria and strengthening the responsibilities of school inspectorates which is expected to lead to a more inclusive education in schools for Roma and other disadvantaged groups. However, in the absence of monitoring criteria progress has yet to be seen. While a number of positive measures have been initiated, these	
3. Curb informal payments in the healthcare system	are unlikely to be sufficient to address the challenge. No progress was made on the equalisation of the pensionable age for men and women. The draft law submitted to Parliament in 2013 has been adopted by the Senate, but not by the lower Chamber. Some progress:	See CSR 2 (healthcare system)
and increase the availability of outpatient care. Strengthen the independence and transparency of human resources management in the public administration. Simplify administrative procedures for business and the public. Strengthen corporate governance of state-owned enterprises.	Some progress was made with curbing informal payments in the healthcare system. In line with the new National Anti-corruption Strategy for 2016-2020, legislation was adopted in November 2016 to revamp the existing patient feedback mechanism. In 2014, the Ministry of Health put in place a patient feedback form mechanism for reporting informal payments. Reporting under the mechanism was not reliable and is now being revamped. The National Anti-corruption Strategy for	See CSR 3 (independence and transparency in public administration)
	2016-2020 adopted in August planned to revise the existing patient feedback mechanism to eliminate the involvement of medical units in the collection of information on patients' experience. Consequently, new legislative measures were adopted in November 2016 to empower patients, also addressing the role of ethics councils in public health units, and sanctions. In addition, the salaries of health professionals have been improved	
	(Emergency Ordinance no. 20 of June 8, 2016 amending and supplementing Government Emergency Ordinance no. 57/2015 on the salaries of staff paid from public funds in 2016). Limited progress was made with increasing the availability of outpatient care. Some measures have been taken in this regard, but overall a shift to outpatient care is still at a very early stage to consider a substantial	
	fulfilment of the recommendation. The Ministry of Health has developed regional healthcare plans that	

include a mapping of needs for infrastructure and services. The regional plans, together with the national health strategy, offer a good basis for the planning of investments from ESIF and other sources. The first monitoring report of the national health strategy has been published mid-2016, the second report being expected in February 2017. A Working Group has been created to address ambulatory care; it is announced that outpatients' centres will be developed in the context of the Regional Plans including a pilot project in the South-West region; on the other hand, on primary healthcare, the budget in 2016 has increased overall 5 % with higher increases (up to 15 %) for the expenditure per capita and the value of the points for service. Nonetheless, the shift to outpatient care is still at a very early stage. Likewise, the implementation of the World Bank's project Health Sector Reform including the target of strengthening ambulatory care is unsatisfactory (World Bank, 2016).

<u>Limited progress</u> was made in human resources management in the public administration. Strategies for Civil Service and Staff Training have been adopted, however the current legislative and institutional set-up makes it hard to effectively implement.

Some progress was made on the simplification of administrative procedures for business and the public. Measures taken in 2016 include emergency ordinance n. 41/2016 to simplify administrative procedures and facilitate relations between citizens and the public administration; and the adoption in November 2016 of first elements of a second legislative package, including emergency ordinance 84/2016 amending the Fiscal Procedure Code contains also measures to simplify administrative procedures for businesses, including e.g. procedures to obtain a fiscal code, for the reactivation of inactive taxpayers, widening the use of remote means of payment (e.g. home banking, mobile banking) to pay taxes, wider provision of e-tools to pay taxes and some specific fee reductions; further development of the RIA framework; introduction of income tax exemptions for R&D tasks and activities, and clarification of tasks and activities exempt from income taxation for IT

professionals; adoption of OUG 35/2016 for the modification and completion of the land registry law 7/1996, important both for agriculture and for infrastructure projects. The substantial measures taken in 2016 to increase transparency (public consultation and debates on draft legislation etc), are being reversed in 2017.

<u>Substantial progress</u> was made in SOEs corporate governance. The bylaws supporting Law 111/2016 on SOEs corporate governance were adopted within the deadline, in October 2016. As Law 111/2016 applies to all SOEs, the Ministry of Finance started contacts with the larger local authorities to improve awareness of the new rules. The H1 2016 budget execution of SOEs under the central government was made public. However, the hiring of professional managers has not yet started raising concerns on the implementation of law 111/2016.

4. Improve access to integrated public services, extend basic infrastructure and foster economic diversification, in particular in rural areas. Adopt and implement the transport master plan. Strengthen public investment project prioritisation and preparation.

Some progress:

Despite delays, in 2016 there was some progress with the completion of action plans for ex-ante conditionality on health, transport, public procurement and RD&I. This has created a basis for strategic planning of future ESIF investments in infrastructure for public services and SMEs. However, the institutional and operational setup of ESIF programmes is still not completed and a few key ex-ante conditionality items are not yet fulfilled, creating a risk of further delays in implementation. 348 projects of a value of 252 million EUR (19% of allocation) for investments in rural infrastructure (roads, water supply/waste water systems, education and social infrastructure) have been contracted. In August 2016 the government further launched a comprehensive IT programme, developed jointly with the private sector, to increase the inter-operability across different levels of administration and the quality of public services (GovITHub). Some progress was made on improving access to integrated services in rural areas, marking a shift from benefits towards service provision. As part of a pilot project, integrated services will be introduced in around 100 most marginalised communities, through teams at community level, mostly in rural areas. When 3. Adopt legislation to ensure a professional and independent civil service, applying objective criteria. Strengthen project prioritisation and preparation in public investment. Ensure the timely full and sustainable implementation of the national public procurement strategy.

scaled up, it can produce substantial progress concerning the provision of integrated services. ESF calls at national level have been launched, covering disadvantaged communities, including in disadvantaged areas. A comprehensive set of measures was adopted in early 2016 aimed at improving living standards, stimulating productivity and economic diversification in the rural areas. A set of measures was adopted in 2016 aimed at increasing the wealth in rural areas and developing the rural middle class. The Rural Development Programme has started to be implemented. Additional 533 projects of a value of 49 MEUR (16% of allocation) for investments in diversification of economic activities and setting-up of non-agricultural activities in rural areas have been contracted. While there is progress on contracting, implementation of the projects on the ground is just starting. Romania still has to spend by 2023 around 1.2 BEUR for investments in rural infrastructure and 275 MEUR for diversification of rural economy.

Some progress. The Transport Master Plan was adopted in September 2016. The Railway Reform Authority, setup in October 2016 and expected to become fully operational by mid-2017, should take the necessary measures to make the operation of railway transport more efficient. To speed up of investments in road infrastructure, the government has also split the national authority in charge of road construction into two bodies, one for infrastructure investments (CNIR) and one for infrastructure administration (CNAIR). Performance contracts between the national companies and the Ministry of Transport are currently developed.

<u>Limited progress</u> was made with strengthening public investment project prioritisation and preparation. In August, a change to the ordinance 88 obliged the line ministries to take into account the public investment priority list in the budget preparation. However, no other steps have been made to enhance the role of the existing public investment prioritisation unit in the Ministry of Finance and to improve the prioritisation and preparation of all public investment projects.

SI

Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 3, 4

1. Following the correction of the excessive deficit, achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,6 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and in 2017. Set a medium-term budgetary objective that respects the requirements of the Stability and Growth Pact. Strengthen the fiscal framework by appointing an independent fiscal council and amending the Public Finance Act. Complete and implement the reform of the long-term care and healthcare systems, making them more cost-efficient to ensure long-term sustainability of accessible and quality care. By the end of 2017, adopt the necessary measures to ensure the long-term sustainability and adequacy of the pension system.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress (this overall evaluation excludes an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact).

The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in Spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

<u>Limited progress</u> was made regarding the fiscal framework. The revised Public Finance Act was adopted by the Parliament in December 2016, but the appointment of the Fiscal Council was further delayed. Following three unsuccessful public calls for applicants, the Government will have to restart an open call for applications to find members for the Fiscal Council.

<u>Limited progress</u> was made regarding long-term care reform. The pilot project to determine long-term care needs and support proposed legislative solutions is being prepared.

Some progress was made regarding healthcare reform. The proposed draft Health Care and Health Insurance Act, which is the central piece of the reform, has been put into public consultations in February 2017 and will be forwarded to the National Assembly in 2017. In December 2016, also the proposals to amend the Health Services Act and the Patient Rights Act were presented and the new Pharmacies Act was adopted.

<u>Limited progress</u> has been made regarding the long-term sustainability and adequacy of pension system. The White Paper on pensions was adopted in April 2016 and has opened a wide public consultation on the future of the pension system. However, the White Paper on pensions is a non-legislative act that needs to be followed up with adoption of legislative acts, needed to address the 2016 CSR.

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 1, 3

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of Slovenia's public finances. Adopt and implement the proposed reform of the healthcare system and adopt the planned reform of long-term care, increasing cost-effectiveness, accessibility and quality care. Fully tap the potential of centralised procurement in the health sector. Adopt the necessary measures to ensure the long-term sustainability and adequacy of the pension system.

2. In consultation with social partners, increase the **Limited progress:** 2. Intensify efforts to increase the employability of lowskilled and older workers, particularly through targeted employability of low-skilled and older workers, including through targeted lifelong learning and lifelong learning and activation measures. **Limited progress** has been made. The analysis of the situation of older workers on the labour market has been activation measures. adopted on 22 December 2016. While the spending on the active labour market policies stayed at the same level, the analysis of their effectiveness is under way. Active labour market policy measures targeting older workers still need to be intensified and the analysis of the effectiveness of active labour market policies is being prepared. It is also not yet clear what will be done as regards to lifelong learning. 3. Improve the financing conditions for creditworthy 3. Improve the financing conditions, including by Some progress: business, including by facilitating durable resolution of facilitating a durable resolution of non-performing loans non- performing loans and access to alternative financing and access to alternative sources of financing. Ensure Some progress has been made on reducing the level of sources. Ensure the proper implementation of the non-performing loans. These loans continue to fall, but the full implementation of the bank asset management bank asset management company strategy. their level is still high. The Bank of Slovenia has company strategy. Reduce the administrative burden implemented a number of measures that are giving banks on business deriving from rules on spatial planning and incentives to reduce their non-performing loans construction permits and ensure good governance of sustainably. They have also shown a willingness to take State-owned enterprises. part in the Structural Reforms Support Service projects, which should further help the process. **Limited progress** has been made regarding improving the financing conditions for creditworthy business by facilitating access to alternative financing sources. The Slovenian Enterprise Fund and the SID bank have introduced only new debt instruments for SMEs including measures such as microcredits. One scheme of seed capital (some EUR 3.9 million) was implemented in 2016 by the Slovenian Enterprise Fund and some 47 SMEs were supported. Other alternative financing instruments, including venture capital and equity are planned with use of ESIF **Some progress** has been made regarding the implementing of the Bank Asset Management Company's strategy. See CSR 3 (reducing administrative burden on business, 4. Take measures to modernise public administration Some progress: and reduce the administrative burden on business. *improving governance of state-owned enterprises)* Improve the governance and the performance of Some progress has been made regarding the modernisation of the public administration and regarding state-owned enterprises. the reduction of the administrative burden. The

implementation the public administration development strategy 2015-2020 is ongoing; however certain specific measures from this strategy have been substantially delayed (i.e. the adoption of the Civil Servants Act). The government programme for reducing the administrative burden is estimated to have created total savings of in total of EUR 365 million of savings between 2009 and 2015. The 9th progress report of the Single Document shows that more than half of 318 measures to reduce the administrative burden have been realised. The SME test was introduced on 1 June 2016 and is now obligatory for all new laws prepared under regular procedure but it is still too soon to assess its effects.

Some progress has been made regarding the governance of state-owned enterprises (SOEs). The Slovenian Sovereign Holding (SSH) is managing SOEs in accordance with the regulatory framework in place. End-2015 results show an improved profitability of SOEs under SSH's management. An asset management plan for 2017, quantifying the performance indicators for each separate SOE and updating a list of assets for divestment has been approved by the government in January 2017. A procedure to appoint a new management board is underway, following the CEOs resignation as a result of pressures exerted on the SSH ahead of its initiative to replace the Port of Koper (Luka Koper) supervisory board.

SK	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
	1. Achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of 0,25 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and of 0,5 % of GDP in 2017. Improve the cost-effectiveness of the healthcare system. Take measures to increase tax compliance.	Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth pact): Limited progress has been made in improving the costeffectiveness of the healthcare system: as a comprehensive spending review has identified major cost inefficiencies and potential cost savings, but these are not yet backed by concrete measures.	1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of Slovakia's public finances. Improve the cost effectiveness of the healthcare system, including by implementing the value for money project.
		<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in improving tax compliance. While some measures have been launched and appear promising, the system as a whole remains too focused on control, with little attention paid to voluntary compliance.	
	2. Improve activation measures for the long-term unemployed and other disadvantaged groups, including individualised services and targeted training. Facilitate the employment of women, in particular by extending the provision of affordable, quality childcare. Improve educational outcomes by making the teaching profession more attractive and by increasing the participation of Roma children from early childhood in mainstream education.	Some progress: Some progress has been achieved in improving activation measures. An action plan on the integration of the long-term unemployed was adopted in late 2016 in order to address the lack of individualised services and training. However, its timely and adequate implementation will need to be monitored. No targeted efforts have been undertaken to help integrate Roma into the labour market.	2. Improve activation measures for disadvantaged groups, including by implementing the action plan for the long-term unemployed and by providing individualised services and targeted training. Enhance employment opportunities for women, especially by extending affordable, quality childcare. Improve the quality of education and increase the participation of Roma in inclusive mainstream education.
		Some progress has been identified in increasing the capacity of and access to early childhood education and care, particularly for the over-threes. For children under three, the number of private facilities has increased slightly but no progress has been made in setting up a legislative framework for childcare services.	
		<u>Limited progress</u> has been made in the educational dimension of the CSR. Some measures have been taken in order to raise the attractiveness of the teaching profession. Substantial annual pay rises have been agreed or are planned for 2016 and 2017. The government aims	

	to raise entry requirements for teaching and improve training. A reform to support socially and ethnically inclusive education, including of Roma pupils, entered into force in 2016, but effectively implementing the reform will require further efforts and political commitment.	
3. Consolidate governance, reinforce the shift from price only to quality-based competition and improve the prosecution of illicit practices in public procurement. Improve the transparency, quality and effectiveness of human resources management in public administration, in particular by adopting a new civil service act, and the effectiveness of the justice system. Adopt a comprehensive plan to address administrative and regulatory barriers for businesses.	Limited progress has been made in improving competition and fighting illicit practices in public procurement. While some initiatives for fostering quality-based procurement procedures have been launched, these are not yet systematic or concrete. Some progress has been made in improving human resource management in public administration. While the new Civil Service Act has the potential to materially improve the situation, this will require determined implementation of the Act, which will be applicable only from the second half of 2017 onwards. Limited progress has been made towards improving the effectiveness of the justice system. Although the new government made this a key priority, the impact of new measures (some of which are still in draft) cannot be assessed yet. No progress has been made in adopting a comprehensive plan to address administrative and regulatory barriers for businesses. In the 2016 national reform programme the Slovak government committed to adopt a corresponding long-term strategy, but the plan has not yet been	3. Improve competition and transparency in public procurement operations and step up the fight against corruption by stronger enforcement of existing legislation. Adopt and implement a comprehensive plan to lower administrative and regulatory barriers for businesses. Improve the effectiveness of the justice system, including a reduction in the length of civil and commercial cases.

formulated.

]	FI

Country Specific Recommendations 2016

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: CSR 2, 3

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1

SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -

1. Achieve an annual fiscal adjustment of at least 0,5 % of GDP towards the medium-term budgetary objective in 2016 and 0,6 % in 2017. Use any windfall gains to accelerate the reduction of the general government debt ratio. Ensure timely adoption and implementation of the administrative reform with a view to better cost-effectiveness of social and healthcare services.

Some progress (this overall evaluation excludes an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact).

The compliance assessment with the Stability and Growth Pact will be included in Spring when final data for 2016 will be available.

Some progress has been made on the adoption and implementation of the social and healthcare reform. The reform has been undertaken in order to ensure the continued access to the good quality services while ensuring the long-term sustainability of public finances. The government has prepared the first half of the draft legislation that is needed for the reform to take effect from 2019. The 27 draft laws have undergone a public consultation. Legislation regarding the freedom of choice for the citizens was not part of the public consultation. The work needs to continue, but thanks to the timely preparation of the legislation creating the new administrative structure, it can be concluded that there is some progress in implementing the recommendation.

1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which implies to achieve its medium term budgetary objective in 2018, taking into account the allowances linked to unusual events, the implementation of the structural reforms and investments for which a temporary deviation is granted. Ensure timely adoption and implementation of the administrative reform to improve cost-effectiveness of social and healthcare services.

2. While respecting the role of social partners, ensure that the wage setting system enhances local wage bargaining and removes rigidities, contributing to competitiveness and a more export industry-led approach. Increase incentives to accept work and ensure targeted and sufficient active labour market measures, including for people with a migrant background. Take measures to reduce regional and skills mismatches.

Some progress:

<u>Substantial progress</u> has been made in ensuring that the wage-setting system enhances local wage bargaining and removes rigidities, contributing to competitiveness and a more export industry-led approach. The social partners agreed on the Competitiveness Pact, which also extends the possibilities for local bargaining. A new wage-setting model is being negotiated for the next round of wage negotiations, where wages in the tradable sector serve as an anchor for the rest of the economy. The extent to which there will be results from the extended local bargaining possibilities remains to be seen.

<u>Some progress</u> has been achieved on incentives to accept work and ensure targeted and sufficient active labour

2. Promote the further alignment of wages with productivity developments, fully respecting the role of social partners. Take targeted active labour market policy measures to address employment and social challenges, provide incentives to accept work and promote entrepreneurship.

market measures, including for people with a migrant background. To increase incentives to accept work among parents of young children, the government has proposed in the 2017 budget the reduction of fees for early childhood education. From the benefits side, Finland has tightened the obligation to accept a job offer and the obligation to participate in activation schemes. The duration of earnings-related unemployment insurance was reduced by one fifth to 400 days. From 2017, mandatory interviews with all the unemployed will be carried out at three-month intervals to monitor progress with the individual employment plans. The government has also introduced additional funding for migrants' integration and a new measure offering immigrants training that will support their employability.

Some progress has been achieved in the area of reducing regional and skills mismatches. The reform of the vocational education system, expected to be finalised in 2018 includes making it more responsive to labour market needs. The rules regarding acceptable commuting distance for jobseekers will be stricter and the unemployment benefit can be used as a mobility allowance.

3. Continue pursuing efforts to **increase competition in services**, including in retail. Promote entrepreneurship and investment, including by **reducing administrative and regulatory burden**, to foster growth of high value added production.

Some progress:

Some progress has been made on competition in services, including retail. Establishment conditions for retail outlets will be eased. The proposed legislation increases the minimum surface of the more tightly regulated large retail units from 2 000 to 4 000 square meters. The possibilities to establish these units in areas other than the city centres will be increased and access to outlets will become a more important factor in the planning than the outlet's nature and size. Transport and gas market reforms have been announced and the draft legislation prepared.

<u>Some progress</u> has been made on the promotion of entrepreneurship and investment and fostering growth of high value added production. In order to promote entrepreneurship, the government put forward a subsidy (grant or a wage subsidy) for one-person companies to

3. Continue to **improve the regulatory framework and reduce the administrative burden** to increase competition in services and to promote investment.

hire a worker, reviewed the rules that guide the	
recruitment of foreign specialists and the creation of a	
public database of inventions that everyone can access	
and exploit. An innovation voucher for SMEs is in	
preparation, aimed at promoting the use of outside	
expertise in innovating and improving products or	
services. The government also plans to combine the	
existing public support instruments into a single 'growth	
service'.	



Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: -

MIP: CSR 1

1.Address the rise in household debt by adjusting fiscal incentives, in particular by gradually limiting the tax deductibility of mortgage interest payments or by increasing recurrent property taxes. Ensure that the macro-prudential authority has the legal mandate to implement measures to safeguard financial stability in a timely manner. Foster investment in housing and improve the efficiency of the housing market. including by introducing more flexibility in setting rental prices and by revising the design of the capital gains tax to facilitate more housing transactions.

Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)

Limited progress (this overall assessment of CSR 1 does not include an assessment of compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact):

No progress in adjusting fiscal incentives, i.e. changing the mortgage interest deductibility rules or property taxation.

Limited progress on enhancing the legal mandate of the macroprudential authority. The authorities have achieved cross-party agreement on strengthening macroprudential authority's mandate. However, concrete proposals are still to be published later in 2017, so it remains uncertain what form the new legal framework will ultimately take (see 4.2.2).

Some progress on fostering investment in housing and improving the efficiency of the housing market. The authorities have put forward a 22-point plan to increase land available for development, further streamline building regulations and shorten planning lead times, and to address a number of other specific inefficiencies in the housing market (see 4.2.3). However, the timeline and precise implementation form of most proposed measures remain uncertain. In addition, no significant policy action has been taken to introduce more flexibility in setting rental prices. A temporary reform of the deferral rules for capital gains taxes on property transaction was introduced, but this will probably have limited effect (as also discussed in 4.2.3).

Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: -

MIP: CSR 1

1. Address risks related to household debt. in particular by gradually limiting the tax deductibility of mortgage interest payments or by increasing recurrent property taxes, while constraining lending at excessive debt-to-income levels. Foster investment in housing and improve the efficiency of the housing market, including by introducing more flexibility in setting rental prices and revising the design of the capital gains tax.

UK	Country Specific Recommendations 2016 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -	Assessment of implementation of CSR 2016 (COM Country Report, February 2017)	Draft Country Specific Recommendations 2017 SGP: CSR 1 MIP: -
	1. Endeavour to correct the excessive deficit in a durable manner by 2016-17. Following the correction of the excessive deficit, achieve a fiscal adjustment of 0,6 % of GDP in 2017-18 towards the minimum medium-term budgetary objective.	CSRs related to compliance with the Stability and Growth Pact will be assessed in spring once the final data is available.	1. Pursue its fiscal policy in line with the requirements of the preventive arm of the Stability and Growth Pact, which translates into a substantial fiscal effort for 2018. When taking policy action, consideration should be given to achieving a fiscal stance that contributes to both strengthening the ongoing recovery and ensuring the sustainability of United Kingdom's public finances.
	2. Address shortfalls in network infrastructure investment, including by delivering the priorities of the National Infrastructure Plan. Take further steps to boost housing supply, including by implementing the reforms of the national planning policy framework.	Some progress: Some progress in addressing shortfalls in infrastructure investment. In the November 2016 Autumn Statement the UK announced a further prioritisation of public capital spending towards transport and other infrastructure. A number of major transport and energy investment decisions have been made in 2016. However it is not clear that the conditions are fully in place to secure the large amount of private funding that the UK is relying on to remedy investment backlogs in a timely and cost-effective way. Some progress on boosting housing supply. The government continues to treat housing as a top policy priority. An ongoing set of reforms should have positive impacts on housing supply, though these will take time and may not be sufficient to address the chronic	2. Take further steps to boost housing supply, including through reforms to planning rules and their implementation.
	3. Address skills mismatches and provide for skills progression, including by strengthening the quality of apprenticeships. Further improve the availability of affordable, high-quality, full-time childcare.	undersupply of housing. Some progress: Some progress in addressing skills and apprenticeship issues. The government has continued with implementation of apprenticeship expansion and reform, including the April 2017 advent of both the Apprenticeship levy and the Institute for Apprenticeships. Wider reform which will contribute to addressing skills mismatches and progression issues is demonstrated in the new Post-16 Skills Plan, which is	3. Address skills mismatches and provide for skills progression, including by continuing to strengthen the quality of apprenticeships and providing for other funded "Further Education" progression routes.

ambitious in intention and will require coherent, committed and timely implementation.	
Some progress in improving childcare availability albeit more mixed progress in the three different elements of affordability, quality and full-time availability. A pilot of the expansion of the doubling of the free childcare offer to three and four year olds has commenced, with full roll-out foreseen for September 2017. However, supply-side concerns, in particular the concerns of providers, appear to require further progress.	

Euro Area	2016 recommendations on the economic policy of the euro area
	1. Pursue policies that support the recovery, foster convergence, facilitate the correction of macroeconomic imbalances and improve adjustment capacity. To this end, Member States, particularly those with large stocks of private and foreign debt, are to implement reforms that enhance productivity, foster job creation, raise competitiveness and improve the business environment. Member States with large current account surpluses are to implement as a priority measures, including structural reforms, that help strengthen their domestic demand and growth potential.
	2. Implement reforms that combine: (i) flexible and reliable labour contracts that promote smooth labour market transitions and avoid a two-tier labour market; (ii) comprehensive lifelong learning strategies; (iii) effective policies to help the unemployed re-enter the labour market; (iv) adequate and sustainable social protection systems that contribute effectively and efficiently throughout the life cycle both to social inclusion and labour market integration; and (v) open and competitive product and services markets.

Assessment of implementation of 2016 recommendations

(COM Report, February 2017)

2017 recommendations on the economic policy of the euro area

- The correction of existing macroeconomic imbalances is taking place, but the **process is uneven**
- Significant progress has been achieved among net debtor countries in correcting their external imbalances, although stocks of net foreign liabilities remain high.
- In contrast, countries with large surpluses and positive stocks of net liabilities have not corrected their surpluses.
- There has been **some progress** in structural reform implementation.

1. Pursue policies that support sustainable and inclusive growth in the short and the long term, and improve adjustment capacity, rebalancing and **convergence.** Prioritise reforms that increase productivity, improve the institutional and business environment, remove bottlenecks to investment, and support job creation. Member States with current account deficits or high external debt should raise productivity while containing unit labour costs. Member States with large current account surpluses should implement, as a priority, measures, including structural reforms and fostering investment, that help to strengthen their domestic demand and growth potential.

ent reforms that combine: (i) flexible and **bour contracts** that promote smooth labour sitions and avoid a two-tier labour market: (ii) nsive lifelong learning strategies; (iii) olicies to help the unemployed re-enter the rket; (iv) adequate and sustainable social systems that contribute effectively and throughout the life cycle both to social and labour market integration; and (v) open petitive product and services markets. Reduce the tax wedge on labour, particularly on low-

earners, in a budgetary-neutral way to foster job creation.

Some progress:

Limited progress:

and slow.

- **Progress has been made** in implementing flexible and reliable labour contracts that promote labour market transitions and avoid a two-tier labour market, particularly in the euro area Member States with both large cumulated imbalances and stringent job protection legislation before the crisis.
- **Some progress** has been made in implementing comprehensive lifelong learning strategies.
- **Some progress** has been made in implementing effective policies to help unemployed re-enter the labour market
- **Some progress** has been made in implementing modern social protection systems that support those in need and provide incentives for labour market integration.
- **Limited progress** has been made in reducing the tax wedge on labour.

3. Implement reforms that promote competitiveness, job creation, job quality, resilience and economic and social convergence, underpinned by an effective social dialogue. They should combine: (i) reliable labour contracts which provide flexibility and security for employees and employers; (ii) quality and efficient education and training systems and comprehensive lifelong learning strategies targeted at labour market needs; (iii) effective active labour market policies to support labour market participation; (iv) modern, sustainable and adequate social protection systems that contribute effectively and efficiently throughout the life cycle to social inclusion and labour market integration. Shift taxes away from labour, particularly for low-income earners and in Member States where cost competitiveness lags behind the euro area average, and make that tax shift budget-neutral in countries without the fiscal room for manoeuvre.

3. Pursue fiscal policies in full respect of the SGP. For 2016, the objective of a broadly neutral aggregate fiscal stance in the euro area appears appropriate in order to reflect a balance between long-term fiscal sustainability and short-term macroeconomic stabilisation. Looking towards 2017, reduce public debt to restore fiscal buffers and avoid pro-cyclicality. Differentiate the fiscal effort by individual Member States in line with their respective positions with regard to the requirements under the SGP while considering stabilisation needs, as well as taking into account possible spillovers across euro area Member States. To this end, review the euro area fiscal stance in the context of the stability programmes and the draft budgetary plans.

Some progress:

- Most Member States <u>broadly complied</u> with the Stability and Growth Pact in 2016. Some benefitted from the flexibility arrangement to promote structural reforms and investment. Two Member States required new deadlines to correct their excessive deficits.
- For 2016, a slightly expansionary fiscal stance is expected, which is deemed appropriate for stabilisation purposes in a still tepid recovery, despite fiscal sustainability needs.
- For 2017, public debt is expected to **fall moderately**.
- <u>Some progress</u> has been made in the coordination of fiscal policies, in particular in terms of delivery of an appropriate aggregate fiscal stance. However, the distribution of the aggregate fiscal stance remains sub-optimal across Member States.
- The euro area fiscal stance was discussed among Member States in the EWG and the Eurogroup in summer 2016 based on the Stability Programmes.

2. Aim for an appropriate balance in fiscal policies between the need to ensure sustainability and the need to support investment to strengthen the recovery, thereby contributing to an appropriate aggregate fiscal stance and a more balanced policy mix. Member States that, according to the Commission assessment, are at risk of not meeting their obligations under the SGP in 2017 should, on that basis, take, in a timely manner, additional measures to ensure compliance. Conversely, Member States that have outperformed their medium-term objectives are invited to continue to prioritise investments to boost potential growth while preserving the long-term sustainability of public finances. Member States that are projected to be broadly compliant with the SGP in 2017 should ensure compliance with the SGP within their national budgetary processes. Pursue fiscal policies in full respect of the SGP, while making the best use of the flexibility embedded within the existing rules. Overall, Member States should improve the composition of public finances by creating more room for tangible and intangible investment, and ensure the effective functioning of national fiscal frameworks.

4. Facilitate the gradual reduction of banks' non- performing loans and improve insolvency proceedings for businesses and households. In Member States with large stocks of private debt, promote an orderly deleveraging, including by facilitating the resolution of unviable private debt.

Some progress:

- The supervisory, the macro-prudential, and resolution frameworks have <u>become fully</u> <u>operational</u>. The Single Resolution Fund have all the resolution powers in place.
- Following the evaluation of the implementation by Member States of the Insolvency Recommendation of 2014, the Commission has engaged in <u>preparing a legislative initiative</u> on pre-insolvency and recovery proceedings. The initiative aims at providing tools that would allow viable businesses in distress to be rescued and honest but bankrupt individuals to be given a second chance.

4. In line with the roadmap of June 2016, continue work to complete the Banking Union with regard to risk reduction and risk sharing, including a European Deposit Insurance Scheme and making the common backstop for the Single Resolution Fund operational at the latest by the end of the Fund's transitional period. Devise and implement an effective euro-area wide strategy to complement prudential supervisory action to address viability risks within the banking sector, including as regards the high level of non-performing loans, inefficient business models and overcapacity. In Member States with large stocks of private debt, promote orderly deleveraging.

5. Work towards completing EMU in an open and transparent manner, while fully supporting the internal market, and further exploring the legal, economic and political aspects of the more long-term measures contained in the Five Presidents' Report.

Some progress:

- The Council <u>adopted</u> the recommendation to set up National Productivity Boards on 20 September 2016.
- The Members of the European Fiscal Board (EFB) <u>have been appointed</u> and the EFB <u>became</u> <u>operational</u> in October 2016.
- Regarding external representation, in June 2016, the Council <u>agreed</u> on some minimal improvements in coordination of IMF issues and agreed to continue discussions on further strengthening the coordination.
- An Ad-hoc Working Group (AHWG) in the Council <u>was set up</u>, which worked on a roadmap to complete the Banking Union. The roadmap was adopted by the Council in June 2016.

5. Make progress on completing EMU, in full respect of the Union's internal market and in an open and transparent manner towards non-euro area Member States. Further advance the ongoing initiatives and work on the longer-term issues for EMU, taking due account of the Commission White Paper on the Future of Europe.

Assessment criteria used by the Commission in its evaluation of Country Specific Recommendations (CSRs) implementation

European Semester 2016 Cycle

- (1) No progress: The Member States (MS) has not credibly announced nor adopted any measures to address the CSR. Below a number of non-exhaustive typical situations that could be covered under this, to be interpreted on a case by case basis taking into account country-specific conditions:
 - no legal, administrative, or budgetary measures have been announced in the National Reform Programme or in other official communication to the national Parliament / relevant parliamentary committees, the European Commission, or announced in public (e.g. in a press statement, information on government's website);
 - no non-legislative acts have been presented by the governing or legislator body;
 - the Member State has taken initial steps in addressing the CSR, such as commissioning a study or setting up a study group to analyse possible measures that would need to be taken (unless the CSR explicitly asks for orientations or exploratory actions), while clearly-specified measure(s) to address the CSR has not been proposed.
- (2) **Limited progress:** The MS has:
 - announced certain measures but these only address the CSR to a limited extent; and/or
 - presented legislative acts in the governing or legislator body but these have not been adopted yet and substantial non-legislative further work is needed before the CSR will be implemented;
 - presented non-legislative acts, yet with no further follow-up in terms of implementation which is needed to address the CSR.
- (3) Some progress: The MS has adopted measures that partly address the CSR and/or the Member State has adopted measures that address the CSR, but a fair amount of work is still needed to fully address the CSR as only a few of the adopted measures have been implemented. For instance: adopted by national parliament; by ministerial decision; but no implementing decisions are in place.
- (4) Substantial progress: The MS has adopted measures that go a long way in addressing the CSR and most of which have been implemented.
- (5) Full implementation: The MS has implemented all measures needed to address the CSR appropriately.

DISCLAIMER: This document is drafted by the Economic Governance Support Unit (EGOV) of the European Parliament based on publicly available information and is provided for information purposes only. The opinions expressed in this document are the sole responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official position of the European Parliament. Reproduction and translation for non-commercial purposes are authorised, provided the source is acknowledged and the publisher is given prior notice and sent a copy. © European Union, 2017